Chinese Grave Problems

The Historical Trajectory of the Republican-Era Sun-Chiang-Soong Families as Mirrored in Their Tombs

Gotelind Müller

Chinese Grave Problems

The Historical Trajectory of the Republican-Era Sun-Chiang-Soong Families as Mirrored in Their Tombs

Gotelind Müller

About the author

Prof. Dr. Gotelind Müller-Saini is professor of Sinology at the Institute of Chinese Studies, University of Heidelberg. Her research interests are modern Chinese history and Sino-Japanese-Western cultural exchange.

Published at CrossAsia-Repository,
Heidelberg University Library 2021

The electronic Open Access version of this work is permanently available on CrossAsia-Repository: http://crossasia-repository.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/
urn: urn:nbn:de:bsz:16-crossasiarep-44747
url: http://crossasia-repository.ub.uni-heidelberg.de/4474
doi: http://doi.org/10.11588/xarep.00004474

ISBN 978-3-948791-19-3 (PDF)

Introduction[1]

When researching into Western and Russian historical cemeteries still extant in Greater China,[2] a topic rarely studied, it struck me that there is even only very limited work on how the tombs of noted Chinese fared over time, and what this may tell. While several tombs of once important historical actors may have been preserved or obliterated simply by chance, others are treated on purpose by the state, either preserved as "heritage" for today's society, or having been razed for practical or ideological reasons. Some have become central points of memorialisation and veneration, including, e.g., the so-called "martyrs' cemeteries" designed by the KMT (Guomindang 國民黨, National People's Party) and later the CCP (Chinese Communist Party) for their respective revolutions.[3] A few tombs have additionally served for denunciation, the most well-known case being the tomb of 12th century "patriotic general" Yue Fei 岳飛 in Hangzhou, whose "wicked" opponent at court, Qin Hui 秦檜 (purportedly the chief instigator for Yue Fei's execution), is made to eternally kneel there, together with his wife, the responsible judge, and a general deserting Yue Fei's side, as statues to be ritually reviled.[4] Some tombs were actively suppressed as a *damnatio memoriae* measure, even if needing dynamite to blow them up as Chiang Kai-shek (Jiang Jieshi 蔣介石) did after the Second Sino-Japanese War in the case of the well-cemented tomb of Wang Jingwei 汪精衛 in Nanking (Nanjing), *the* "traitor" of modern times because of his collaboration with the Japanese.[5] The style of symbolic "eternal atonement" by kneeling statues had undergone a renaissance since the outbreak of the Second

[1] Technical note: I opt for keeping the most widely used English-language spelling for Chinese names or places in the present study (at times there were more than one), adding standard *pinyin* only once for reference, since the majority of the people discussed here never used the mainland Chinese *pinyin* spelling for themselves. (Otherwise, I use *pinyin* for Chinese, and characters appear as in the original in traditional or abbreviated form, depending on the source or time and place.)

[2] Cf. my earlier studies: Gotelind Müller: *Challenging dead: a look into foreigners' cemeteries in Macau, Hong Kong and Taiwan*, Heidelberg and Berlin: CrossAsia-Repository, 2018, DOI: https://doi.org/10.11588/xarep.00004145; Gotelind Müller: *Between history, heritage, and foreign relations: extant Westerners' cemeteries in Guangzhou and Shanghai*, Heidelberg and Berlin: CrossAsia-Repository, 2018, DOI: https://doi.org/10.11588/xarep.00004163; Gotelind Müller: *Ambivalent remains: China and the Russian cemeteries in Harbin, Dalian and Lüshun*, Heidelberg and Berlin: CrossAsia Repository 2019, DOI: https://doi.org/10.11588/xarep.00004181; Gotelind Müller: „Whose heritage? Western and Russian tombs on Chinese soil as tangible sites of alterity". In: Gotelind Müller/Nikolay Samoylov (eds.): *Chinese Perceptions of Russia and the West: Changes, Continuities, and Contingencies during the Twentieth Century*, Heidelberg: CrossAsia-eBooks 2020, pp. 465-505.

[3] Cf. Chang-tai Hung: "The Cult of the Red Martyr: Politics of Commemoration in China". In: *Journal of Contemporary History* vol. 43, no. 2, 2008, pp. 279-304. On the preceding KMT efforts, see Rebecca Nedostup: "Two tombs: Thoughts on Zhu Yuangzhang, the Kuomintang, and the Meanings of National Heroes". In: Sarah Schneewind (ed.*): Long Live the Emperor! Uses of the Ming Founder across Six Centuries of East Asian History*, Minneapolis: Society for Ming Studies 2008, pp. 381-383. And still earlier for the "martyrs" of the failed Huanghuagang Uprising of 1911, see Virgil Kit-yiu Ho: "Martyrs or ghosts? A short cultural history of a tomb in revolutionary Canton, 1911-1970". In: *East Asian History* 27, 2004, pp. 99-138. More broadly for Republican times, see Linh Dam Vu: "The Sovereignty of the War Dead: Martyrs, Memorials, and the Makings of Modern China, 1912-1949", PhD diss. Berkeley 2017.

[4] This practice went back to Ming times. Cf. Huang Donglan: "Shrines of Yue Fei: Spaces of creation of public memory". In: *Chinese Sociology and Anthropology* vol. 37, no. 2-3. 2005, pp. 74-112. Since the statues repeatedly suffered from the treatment, they had to be recast several times. For the larger context of Yue Fei worship, see also Marc André Matten: "The worship of general Yue Fei and his problematic creation as a national hero in twentieth century China". In: *Frontiers of History in China* no. 6 (1), 2011, pp. 74-94.

[5] Cf. the recent contribution by Jeremy E. Taylor: "From Traitor to Martyr: Drawing Lessons from the Death and Burial of Wang Jingwei, 1944". In: *Journal of Chinese History* vol. 3, no. 1, 2019, pp. 137-158. Available online: DOI: https://doi.org/10.1017/jch.2017.43.

Sino-Japanese War, connected by then to the issue of collaboration vs patriotism, but redirected to face "the people" or "history" instead of a specific individual victim like Yue Fei. In PRC (People's Republic of China) times, this was combined with the place of Wang's former tomb by putting up his kneeling statue there, thus marking the "deleted" spot anew, turning it into one of shame.[6] In any case, the look at history from this peculiar angle of tombs – from below in a very literal sense – proved to open up a somewhat different perspective on well-known and less well-known aspects and people in history, foreign or Chinese, as the well-established one. Although this basically holds true for tombs of all ages – and not the least the Cultural Revolution showed that even people long dead can be turned into "bones of contention" also centuries later –,[7] the more recent tombs of the 20th century are of particular salience. Families may be still around in these cases, and competing narratives and claims to people from various quarters often coexist.

Tombs are usually private and a family affair, but they can be nationalised, e.g. with the military where families are at the margins at best, or with important politicians and public luminaries. Given the contested evaluation of many of the outstanding Republican-era (1911-1949) figures in the subsequent PRC, but also in post-war Taiwan, it follows that the way someone is remembered physically with a tomb, be the interment before or after 1949, tells much about shifts in politics on both sides of the Taiwan Strait over time, ever since the person died.[8] This involves several questions: Who has a say with the interment of such "important" figures? The family or the state? Who is denoted as the bereaved, and who might be even glossed over or brushed aside to not "taint" a certain framed remembrance, anchored physically in the tomb and tombstone? And how about the family members affected and their respective own options?

It goes without saying that such "grave problems" are not peculiar to China. One may cite the recent case of General Franco in Spain, whose remains were shifted (after a long legal back and fro with the family) by the Socialist government in October 2019 from the pompous Valle de los Caídos (Valley of the Fallen) he had ordered himself to be constructed,[9] to the "normal"

[6] For a photograph of the "kneeling statue" of Wang Jingwei, the "culprit", in semblance to Qin Hui, but without a "victim" opposed, see Yang Guoqing 杨国庆: *Minguo mingren mu* 民国名人墓 (Tombs of Republican luminaries), Nanjing: Jiangsu guji chubanshe 1998, p. 232. This means, Wang Jingwei is just kneeling in front of "history" on his (razed) tomb.

[7] Cf. the treatment of the tomb of Confucius and his descendants (cf. Sang Ye and Geremie R. Barmé: "Commemorating Confucius in 1966-67. The Fate of the Confucius Temple, the Kong Mansion and Kong Cemetery". In: *The China Heritage Quarterly* no. 20, December 2009: available online: http://www.chinaheritagequarterly.org/scholarship.php?searchterm=020_confucius.inc&issue=020), but also, e.g., of the official Hai Rui 海瑞 of Ming times, whose dismissal by the emperor as treated in historian Wu Han's 吴晗 play was attacked as a veiled criticism of Mao's dismissal of general Peng Dehuai 彭德怀 of 1959.

[8] Cf. the most pertinent (though not strictly scholarly) Chinese publication on the subject: the already mentioned Yang Guoqing: *Minguo mingren mu* 1998, which covers a large range of people (including some pre-1912 revolutionaries) with short descriptions of the individuals and their tombs.

[9] For a comparative view on the Valle de los Caídos, the basilica and monuments of which were built by forced labour, serving as Franco's burial site but also "integrating" many "fallen" of the Republicans' side, if Catholic (since the place is looked after by the Catholic Church), without necessarily asking for their families' consent, see Gwendolyn Leick: *Tombs of Great Leaders: A Contemporary Guide*, London: Reaktion Books 2013, pp. 104-118. The whole ensemble is a Spanish Royal site (Reales Sitios de España). The official guidebook by the Spanish national heritage institution, Patrimonio Nacional, available on spot in various languages, rather focuses on the less controversial architectonical features: José Luis Sancho: *Santa Cruz del Valle de los Caídos*, Madrid:

family tomb in Madrid's suburbs to join his wife posthumously.[10] Such post-mortem "normalising" moves as a politically willed "downgrade" are frequent with important figures who have become politically "problematic"[11] – more often than not disregarding or overruling any potential family say. The following look at the cases of the Sun 孫-Chiang (Jiang 蔣)-Soong (Song) 宋 families, who were crucial players in Chinese 20th century history, attempts to take a somewhat different perspective on them as the familiar political one, which often was highly scripted,[12] by focusing on the tombs and the family context of the individual political "V.I.P.s". On a side note, it also argues for making better use of available historical photographs to countercheck received (scripted) statements. The named families were entangled with China, North America and the Soviet Union as well as Japan to various degrees, reflecting the multifaceted trajectory of modern Chinese history in a transnational context in their own way. Furthermore, the look to tombs also opens up windows on the roles of religion as well as gender (and partly ethnicity) at the intersection of the public and the private. Finally, it involves questions of heritagisation and contests about post-mortem appropriation of individuals.

The topic of the Sun-Chiang-Soong families and their tombs came up in the context of my previous work on extant foreigners' cemeteries in Greater China, namely with the most well-known of them in Shanghai, located in what today is called the "Song Qingling Memorial Park" (Song Qingling lingyuan 宋庆龄陵园). As I have concluded,[13] the present set-up of the cemetery area in today's park, though formerly the "International Cemetery" (*wanguo gongmu* 萬國公墓), is largely new, be it the "foreigners' cemetery" section, be it the "cemetery of famous Chinese" section. Intriguingly, in spite of the name of today's park which is even officially designated a "national-level patriotic education showcase base", it is not the tomb of former "Honorary President of the PRC", Soong Ching-ling (Song Qingling),[14] but the tomb of the Soong parents which is the central node of it all. The parents' present-day tombstone (a re-make) figures all the names of the politically diverse six Soong siblings as the bereaved, whose names were sensitive to mention during much of PRC history. At the same time, though, other things are invisible on today's tombstone, namely the Christian identity of the Soong parents and anything that might look "un-Chinese" (like Biblical phrases in English – see below). Of the siblings, only Soong Ching-ling is buried at the side of the parents, paralleled with her housekeeper on the other side. This very peculiar set-up begged the question as to the background story, and since this tomb implies political (and religious) connections, and, of

Patrimonio Nacional 2016. According to the guidebook, the basilica and therein Franco's burial site close to the altar were ready in 1959, so to mark the place in ideological terms before his own demise, the remains of José Antonio Primo de Rivera, the founder of the Falanche, were moved from the near-by Escorial to the basilica and situated close to Franco's future tomb. Franco himself would be buried in this tomb when he died in 1975.

[10] For the shift, see: "Franco's Remains Are Exhumed and Reburied After Bitter Battle". In: *The New York Times*, October 24, 2019. One problem that came up during the Franco law suit was that there was another family tomb in the central cathedral of Madrid where his daughter is buried. To shift him there as proposed by the Franco family would have been even worse in the eyes of the Socialist government which wanted to block further "pilgrimages" of rightists to his grave by the relocation.

[11] Cf. Katherine Verdery: *The Political Lives of Dead Bodies: Reburial and Postsocialist Change*, New York: Columbia University Press 1999, with a focus on post-Cold War Eastern Europe.

[12] As has been frequently noted, the actors were very conscious of their high profile and attempted to control much of the writing on them during their lifetimes. On the other hand, political considerations in the PRC as well as in Taiwan have framed the writing on them, too, often editing out "inconvenient" aspects.

[13] See Müller: *Between History* (2018), pp. 13-31.

[14] She herself continued in PRC times to use "SCL" as her acronym, not switching to *pinyin*.

course, the larger family, the background story drew in the in-law families of the Suns and the Chiangs (and to some degree also the Kungs) as well. As it turned out, they had similar "grave problems" of their own, which reflect the more general issue of the (trans)national entanglement tombs of Chinese historical actors of Republican times are sometimes bound up with, which not only affected the dead luminaries themselves, but also their families. In short, those tombs had implications and a historical trajectory of their own, given the plurality of "stake-holders" and interests involved, and given the changes the respective contexts underwent.

Much has been written already on the famous Soong sisters and their marriages which created a personal web of several key historical actors of 20th century China. Briefly summarised, Soong Ai-ling (Song Ailing 宋靄齡), the eldest of the three sisters and of all the Soong siblings, would be the second and last wife of the richest banker of the time, H.H. Kung (Kong Xiangxi 孔祥熙), a Protestant and U.S.-educated as well. He financed many political endeavours of the KMT, acted in various political functions, and embodied also a connection to Chinese tradition as member of a family branch claiming descent from Confucius. Soong Ching-ling (Song Qingling 宋慶齡), the second sister, would become the last wife of Sun Yat-sen (Sun Yixian 孫逸仙, in Chinese more commonly referred to as Sun Zhongshan 孫中山), a baptised Protestant, key revolutionary of modern China and "father of the Republic", with strong connections to the West and Japan. Soong May-ling (Song Meiling 宋美齡), the youngest of the sisters, finally would become the last wife of Chiang Kai-shek, the "strongman" of the KMT after Sun Yat-sen's death and the only husband without a Western and Christian background before the marriage (he was baptised thereafter), though with connections to Japan. He was also the only one not speaking English. Chiang, however, would become a father-in-law of a Soviet woman over his son and successor Chiang Ching-kuo (Jiang Jingguo 蔣經國), a fluent speaker of Russian.[15]

[15] Interest in the lives of the named individuals has generated a substantial amount of publications in Chinese, though often less scholarly than popular-journalistic, or in the memoir style of people who knew them (or tried to put forward their own version of events). Often, such publications are related to the agenda of "furthering cross-Strait ties" and the "one China" doctrine. For standard Western English-language biographical reference, it may suffice to just name one per person: on Sun Yat-sen who has received the most of any strictly scholarly treatment: Marie-Claire Bergère, a historian: *Sun Yat-sen*, translated from the French by Janet Lloyd, Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press 1998. Jay Taylor, a U.S. foreign service officer turned researcher who knew the "two Chiangs", i.e. Chiang Kai-shek and his successor and son, Chiang Ching-kuo, personally, published: on Chiang Kai-shek: *The Generalissimo: Chiang Kai-shek and the Struggle for Modern China*, Cambridge, Mass. [et al.]: Belknap Press of Harvard Univ. Press 2009; and on Chiang Ching-kuo: Jay Taylor: *The Generalissimo's Son: Chiang Ching-kuo and the Revolution in China and Taiwan*, Cambridge/Mass.: Harvard University Press 2000. On Soong May-ling: Hannah Pakula, an author specialising in books on remarkable women: *The Last Empress: Madame Chiang Kai-Shek and the Birth of Modern China*, New York, NY: Simon & Schuster 2009. On Soong Ching-ling: Israel Epstein, a Communist journalist who knew her over decades: *Woman in World History: Life and Times of Soong Ching Ling (Mme. Sun Yat-sen)*, Beijing: New World Press 1993. A very recent addition regarding the "three sisters" between lore and history with a notable revisionist thrust is by the mainland-born writer Jung Chang, living since decades in the UK, who had written a short book on Soong Ching-ling in 1986 with her British husband, now dealing with all three of the sisters: Jung Chang: *Big Sister, Little Sister, Red Sister: Three Women at the Heart of Twentieth-Century China*, London: Jonathan Cape 2019.

The three Soong brothers were much less in the spotlight than their sisters, though above all the eldest of them, T.V. Soong (Song Ziwen 宋子文), born after Ai-ling and Ching-ling and before May-ling, was very influential in his own right.[16] He raised money for the KMT and acted for considerable time as minister of finance, head of the Bank of China, and as a key figure in foreign affairs, i.a. stationed in Washington, D.C., while the less prominent younger brothers T.L. Soong (Song Ziliang 宋子良) and T.A. Soong (Song Zian 宋子安) were influential active players in the financing sector as well.[17]

The named historical actors still attract considerable interest of readers, especially in mainland China where Communist historiography has officially reviled most of them for a long time (with the exception of Sun Yat-sen and his widow Soong Ching-ling). Chen Boda 陳伯達, Mao Zedong's 毛澤東 chief ideologue and secretary, had fixed the verdict for the Communists with his 1947 booklet on the "four big clans" who monopolised and exploited China in Republican times, according to his (and Mao's) view. This intended the Chiangs, Soongs, Kungs, and the Chens, i.e. the right-wing brothers Chen Guofu 陳果夫 and Chen Lifu 陳立夫, the latter being Chiang Kai-shek's chief ideologue and thus more or less Chen Boda's KMT counterpart. Chen Boda's Communist pamphlet was notably republished in Taiwan in 1998 as a left-wing attack on the Chiangs, whose time of domination of the island had by then passed into history.[18] In fact, in reverse perspective, the heightened mainland publication activity on the formerly reviled V.I.P.s during the first era of DPP (Democratic Progressive Party, Minzhu jinbu dang 民主進步黨) government (2000-2008) on Taiwan suggests also the political wish of the mainland to strengthen the links with Taiwan's KMT, stemming the tide of Taiwan's spiralling away from the mainland under DPP aegis.

Whatever the evaluation of the named personalities, they not only mirrored an important part of Republican-era history in China, but also the close relations to the West – not the least over the issues of religion, education, and language use[19] – as well as to the Soviet Union, and to Japan. Their family connections chime in with the politics of the time, with the Protestant and

[16] For T.V. Soong, see the research paper published at the Hoover Institution where his archives are held: Kuo, Tai-chun and Lin, Hsiao-ting: *T.V. Soong in Modern Chinese History: A Look at his Role in Sino-American Relations in World War II*, Stanford: Hoover Institution Press 2006, available online: https://www.hoover.org/sites/default/files/uploads/documents/tv-soong-in-modern-chinese-history.pdf. See also the (only to a very limited degree bi-lingual) volume of the Shanghai Fudan University scholar Wu Jingping together with the Taiwan-born Hoover research fellow Kuo Tai-chun: Wu Jingping 吳景平 and Kuo Tai-chun [Guo Daijun] 郭岱君 (eds.): *Song Ziwen yu tade shidai* 宋子文與他的時代 / *T.V. Soong: His Life and Times*, Taiwan edition: Taibei: Shangxun wenhua 2013 (first published in Shanghai 2008), which, however, presents a clearly filtered narrative, circumnavigating or skipping anything potentially controversial, especially considering mainland readership, but endorsed by T.V. Soong's family, too.

[17] For the financial activities of all these actors during the Nanking Decade (1927-1937), see Parks M. Coble, Jr.: *The Shanghai Capitalists and the Nationalist Government, 1927-1937*, Cambridge/Mass.: Harvard University Press 1980.

[18] Cf. Chen Boda 陳伯達: *Jiang, Song, Kong, Chen: Zhongguo si da jiazu* 蔣宋孔陳: 中國四大家族 (The Chiangs, Soongs, Kungs, Chens: the four big clans of China), Taibei: Yiqiao chubanshe 1998.

[19] As will be noted below, beyond at least formally sharing Protestantism, English played an often underestimated role in the relationship *between* those key Chinese actors.

U.S.-educated Soong family as the central hub.[20] While the saga of these interconnected families has been treated several times, often more in a popular than scientific fashion, and even in films or TV series, concentrating on their colourful lives,[21] after the historical actors' death, their personal archives and historical materials, formerly kept by the families, have mainly been handed to the Hoover Institution Archives at Stanford. Family mistrust towards present-day "post-Chiang" Taiwan has added to (if not even topped) the received one towards the PRC,[22] thus suggesting the U.S. as a "safer" (and more "neutral") place for preservation for the time being. But how do the deaths, burials and tombs of these actors reflect on their lives, afterlives, embeddedness, and roles in history? And how were they situated at the intersection of the public and the private?

The Suns

If one looks at the central figures in Chinese Republican times considered here, with hardly any of them burial was an easy affair. In the case of Sun Yat-sen (died 1925), a baptised Protestant since 1884 – as has been documented in spite of other claims put forward by himself (see below), his already well-studied funeral process was carefully designed over years.[23] Immediately after his death in Peking (Beijing), religious family rites dominated by his Protestant Soong in-laws followed, who felt the need to assure the religious sceptics in the KMT of whom several were active in the ongoing anti-Christian movement of the 1920s, that Sun's Christianity was not "orthodox", but "revolutionary". (One may recall the fact that the anti-religious and especially anti-Christian movement in China had been in particular set off

[20] Cf. the much-debated journalist Seagrave's influential polemic book: Sterling Seagrave: *The Soong Dynasty*, New York, NY [et al.]: Harper & Row, 1985. For a scholarly review of this book, see Jonathan Spence: "The clan that changed China". In: *The New York Times*, March 17, 1985, section 7, p. 1.

[21] For a widely received film on the Soong sisters, see: *The Soong Sisters* / *Songjia Huangchao* 宋家皇朝, Hong Kong, PR China, Japan, historical drama, 1996/97. Films and TV series on Sun Yat-sen and Chiang Kai-shek (at times together with his son Chiang Ching-kuo as the "two Chiangs") are numerous. Notably, though, in 2017, a 30-part TV series dedicated to Charlie (Yaoru) Soong, the less familiar father of the siblings, was running in the PRC: *Song Yaoru: fuqin* 《宋耀如·父亲》 (Song Yaoru: Father), CCTV TV-drama 2017. Available online: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zYRRF_L9UHo&list=PLIj4BzSwQ-_u1ZP36smEphXGU23fZ7wzd.

[22] T.V. Soong's papers are kept at Hoover and according to his wish were more broadly released only after the death of the last Soong sibling, Soong May-ling, in 2003. The family of H.H. Kung, T.V.'s brother-in-law, also donated Kung's documents to Hoover. The same holds true for the (edited) diaries of Chiang Kai-shek and his son Chiang Ching-kuo 蔣經國, the family being concerned about the anti-Chiang sentiments in Taiwan. Especially the widow of Ching-kuo's youngest son who lives in North America emerged as a key figure in the transmission. She also contributed to an exhibition on the Soong family in Shanghai in 2016, advertised in the PRC official English-language newspaper *China Daily*: "Reunited at long last", May 21, 2016, which suggests the ties with the PRC are growing. One may also note that Hoover and Shanghai's prestigious Fudan University have an official cooperation.

[23] Studies on Sun's death and funeral include Henrietta Harrison: *The Making of the Republican Citizen: Political Ceremonies and Symbols in China, 1911-1929*, Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press 2000, chapter 4 and 6; and Rudolf G. Wagner: "Ritual, Architecture, Politics, and Publicity during the Republic: Enshrining Sun Yat-sen". In: Jeffrey W. Cody, Nancy S. Steinhardt, Tony Atkin (eds.): *Chinese Architecture and the Beaux-Arts*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, Hong Kong University Press 2011, pp. 223-278.

precisely in Peking by the 1922 World Student Christian Federation congress.)[24] Notably, Sun's brother-in-law, T.V. Soong, not Sun's son Sun Fo (Sun Ke 孫科), who would normally be the responsible in such circumstances (or Sun's widow Soong Ching-ling), issued a statement "on behalf of the family" to explain the private Christian funeral service against "misrepresentations".[25] Later, in PRC times, Soong Ching-ling would claim the Christian funeral had been done only on insistence of Sun Fo and her brother-in-law H.H. Kung, both *personae non gratae* in Communist view – and thus shifting the "responsibility" away from her Soong family (namely of brother T.V.).[26]

Sun, in fact, had a rather complex relationship with Christianity. In his youth when joining his elder brother Sun Mei 孫眉 in Hawai'i who was critical towards Christianity but financed his much younger brother's schooling (in missionary-led institutions) there,[27] he nearly risked a breakup of his natal family when he voiced the intention of becoming a Christian. He quarrelled with his elder brother who rather sent him back home to their natal village Cuiheng 翠亨 in Guangdong's Xiangshan 香山 County. There, however, Sun Yat-sen upset the villagers by vandalising a statue in the village temple with his younger friend Lu Haodong 陸皓東 in 1883 as a demonstration of iconoclasm. Sun's parents had a hard time to appease the villagers thereafter, while he quickly moved to Hong Kong where he would be baptised, together with Lu Haodong, in 1884 by Rev. Charles Hager, an American pastor of the Congregational Church, as documents have clarified.[28] This also set straight Sun's own claim forwarded later in his "Reminiscences" directed at a Western readership when he had become provisional president of the Republic in 1912, that he was born a Christian, his father having been a convert already![29]

At his death, however, Sun had since long stopped going to church.[30] Theological premises or Christian family values obviously were not much on his mind as proven by his private life, and at least once he committed a false oath in the U.S. in 1904, swearing to have been born in

[24] For a general overview of this movement, see Ka-che Yip: *Religion, Nationalism, and Chinese Students: The Anti-Christian Movement of 1922-1927*, Bellingham/Washington: Center for East Asian Studies, Western Washington University 1980. And Jessie G. Lutz: *Chinese Politics and Christian Missions: The Anti-Christian Movements of 1920–28*, Notre Dame: Cross Cultural Publ. 1988.

[25] See "Late Dr. Sun Yat-sen: in justice to his memory: Christian funeral service explained". In: *South China Morning Post*, March 30, 1925, p. 12. The statement stressed the "not orthodox" character of Sun Yat-sen's understanding of Christianity as a revolutionary endeavour beyond clerical dogmas. For the Chinese version, see: "Sun Zhongshan Yejiaoguan zhi zhuiji" 孫中山耶教觀之追紀 (Tracing Sun Yat-sen's view on Christianity). In: *Shenbao* 申報, March 28, 1925, p. 5.

[26] Cf. her Communist biographer Epstein: *Woman in World History* 1993, p. 135, referring to a "handwritten note" he had received from her in April 1976. Missionaries at the time of Sun's death claimed he had asked for that himself in his last days.

[27] Cf. Irma Tam Soong (a distant relative of Sun Yat-sen via the Tam family): „Sun Yat-sen's Christian schooling in Hawai'i". In: *The Hawaiian Journal of History* vol. 31, 1997, pp. 151-178.

[28] Sun was 18 years old at the time. For the baptism record in reproduction, see, e.g., *Sun Zhongshan jinianguan zhanlan tulu* 孫中山紀念館展覽圖錄 / *Dr Sun Yat-sen Museum Exhibition Catalogue* (bi-lingual), Hong Kong: Sun Zhongshan jinianguan 2006, p. 154.

[29] See his signed "My Reminiscences", published in English in the London *The Strand Magazine* in 1912 (pp. 301-307).

[30] Cf. Audrey Wells: *The Political Thought of Sun Yat-sen: Development and Impact*, Basingstoke et al.: Palgrave 2001, p. 102.

Hawai'i – something he tried to deny later as a mere rumour spread by others.[31] In fact, revolutionary expediencies often conflicted with Christian morals.[32] His first wife, Lu Muzhen 盧慕貞, however, who had become a devout Christian and was active in the Macau Baptist community ever since he divorced her in 1915,[33] described Sun Yat-sen in Christian terms after his death in a letter she purportedly wrote when asked to portray him and herself. Although she had never lived much with him over the years since their marriage back in 1884, and was officially divorced since a decade at his death in 1925, she was convinced that he was a believer until his very last. Their common son Sun Fo, who was present at his death and who had shared somewhat more of his father's life in the latter's last years than she had,[34] had at least told her to have witnessed this in Sun's last days.[35] After the Christian "family funeral ceremony", which was legitimated by T.V. Soong, who also acted as chief testimony of his official last will,[36] as in accordance with Sun's own wishes, Sun's remains became, however, fully part of the KMT and the state, which dropped the Christian identity and turned Sun into an ideological "nationalised" icon.

The whole process of Sun's laying-to-rest was to become a showcase for a KMT state funeral, with a modern mausoleum built in Nanking. Its blended architecture took inspiration from the Lincoln memorial as well as from Chinese traditional architecture to reflect his international life as a globally itinerant revolutionist, as well as his national(ist) ambitions as the "father of the Republic".[37] The transfer of his corpse to the South to his Nanking mausoleum, four years after his death, was to become a carefully orchestrated media event.[38] The final resting place being close to the Ming dynasty founding emperor Zhu Yuanzhang's 朱元璋 tomb in the

[31] For photos of the signed documents, see his relative, Victor Sun: *Sun Mei, My Great-Grandfather*, ebook, copyright Victor Sun, 2012, chapter 8, and the substantial documentation on the Dr. Sun Yat-sen Hawai'i Foundation's website: http://sunyatsenhawaii.org/2008/10/22/fifth-visit-september-1903-march-1904/. (This, again, sets straight the statement of Sun given to his devoted biographer Linebarger during their interviews in 1919 in Shanghai, that concerning his Hawai'ian birth, this "report had been circulated" by "over-zealous followers" "on their own accord". See Paul Linebarger: *Sun Yat Sen and the Chinese Republic*, New York and London: The Century Co. 1925, p. 5.)

[32] Needless to say, also Sun's secret society links with their "heathen" rituals did not sit easily with Christianity per se.

[33] Though it is sometimes stated that she became a Christian only at the time of the divorce, according to Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012, Appendix 1), Lu Muzhen was a Christian already in Hawai'i (if not earlier) and took also Sun Mei's wife with her on Sundays, who however did not convert because of Sun Mei's opposition. Lu Muzhen's Christian belief rendered Sun's divorce and remarriage doubly offensive in the eyes of Western missionaries as well as Chinese Christians (including the Soongs).

[34] Sun Fo had returned to China in 1917 from the U.S.

[35] See the highly interesting letter of Lu Muzhen (if authentic) to the Xiangshan 香山 county Chamber of Commerce, providing her version of Sun's – and her – life, cited in Shen Feide 沈飞德: *Minguo diyi jia: Sun Zhongshan de qinshu yu houyi* 民国第一家: 孙中山的亲属与后裔 (The Republic's First Family: Sun Zhongshan's relatives and descendants), Shanghai: Shanghai renmin chubanshe 2002, pp. 71-72, after Taiwanese scholar Zhuang Zheng 莊政. (Shen Feide's book is for general readers and bases itself largely on oral history – and material accessible in Shanghai or collected in Sun's Cuiheng memorial.)

[36] One may note that on Sun's signed last will to the Party, penned by Wang Jingwei, the head of testimonies was T.V. Soong and only then Sun Fo. (Soong Ching-ling had no official part in this Party affair.)

[37] See Delin Lai: "Searching for a Modern Chinese Monument: The Design of the Sun Yat-sen Mausoleum in Nanjing". In: *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians*, vol. 64, no. 1, 2005, pp. 22-55. See also Charles D. Musgrove: *China's Contested Capital: Architecture, Ritual, and Response in Nanjing*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press 2013, chapter 4.

[38] There were even short films on it.

Purple Mountains, as he was said to have wished himself, the location choice was a political statement in multiple ways. It payed tribute to his revolution against the Manchu-Qing (who had ousted the "Chinese" Ming).[39] But the choice of Nanking as such (and not, e.g., his home in Guangdong as the "normal" and "private" alternative) reflected also the fact, that he had been sworn in here as provisional president of the new Republic in 1912, which was the peak – if a brief one – of his official career. Furthermore, Nanking was where by now Chiang Kai-shek had encamped the KMT government, and the KMT-state now acted as Sun's true "family". The whole process of burying Sun Yat-sen thus only ended in 1929,[40] the mausoleum serving as a key memorial in China to this day.[41] Sun's closest family (excluding his politically active KMT in-laws like H.H. Kung, T.V. Soong, and posthumous brother-in-law Chiang Kai-shek) had no decisive say in these party-dominated decisions, though his only son Sun Fo, and to some degree Sun's last wife Soong Ching-ling, were integrated in the process. More importantly for our concern, his nationalised tomb also meant in practice that none of the closest family members was entitled to join Sun at their own deaths, and thus they had to arrange for themselves.

Whom to count as "Sun's family" was, in any case, fairly complicated. On the one hand, there was his first wife Lu Muzhen, a marriage arranged by his much elder brother Sun Mei in 1884 who accordingly also felt obliged to her ever since. She was the daughter of a business friend of Sun Mei from a village not far from Cuiheng who did business among overseas Chinese in Hawai'i.[42] While Sun was studying medicine in Canton (Guangzhou) and Hong Kong, she was caring for the family, namely Sun's father who became critically ill and died in 1888, both of his sons having come back in time to share his last days. Although Lu Muzhen had no formal schooling, she had received enough education at home to be able to provide some basic

[39] However, the founding of the Republic also ended imperial China as such, and thus his tomb was placed "higher" than Zhu Yuanzhang's. Staying "close to" some imperial or noted figure recalls the Chinese tradition of "burying in proximity" (*fuzang* 附葬), assuming also that the noted figures had chosen particularly "auspicious" sites (in terms of *fengshui* 風水, i.e. geomancy) which one would like to share in. As noted below, Chiang Kai-shek had also reserved a place close to Sun for himself later. For a comparative look at the burials of Sun, Chiang and Mao Zedong, see Frederic Wakeman, Jr.: "Revolutionary Rites: The Remains of Chiang Kai-shek and Mao Tse-tung". In: *Representations* vol. 10, 1985, pp. 146-193. On Sun as a model for the other two, see there: pp. 149-150. For the non-secular implications of *fuzang* in supposedly "anti-superstitious" Republican China, see Ho: "Martyrs or Ghosts" (2004), p. 105ff.

[40] It should be noted that in China a late burial is not uncommon, e.g. to wait for an auspicious date. For an English-language press description of the burial ceremony in 1929 in Nanjing, see: "China pays homage to Sun Yat-sen in great burial ceremony". In: *The China Weekly Review*, June 8, 1929, p. 55.

[41] Cf. Li Gongzhong 李恭忠: *Zhongshanling: Yige xiandai zhengzhi fuhao de dansheng* 中山陵。一个现代政治符号的诞生 ("Sun Yat-sen's Mausoleum: The Making of A Political Symbol in Modern China"), Beijing: Shehui kexue wenxian chubanshe 2009.

[42] There are several, if short, biographical notes on her, e.g. in Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, or by Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012. Cf. also the short biography with archival photos of Lu Muzhen of her "hometown" Zhuhai 珠海 (the present-day city neighbouring Zhongshan and Macau which incorporates her native village today): "Lu Mu-chen (Sun Loo Shee, Lu Muzhen)", 2019, available online: http://www.cityofzhuhai.com/2019-10/31/c_421265.htm. For her own autobiographical account – if authentic – see the already named letter cited in Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002), pp. 71-72. The Hong Kong Dr Sun Yat-sen Museum has done an exhibition in 2012 on Lu Muzhen. See the website: "Dr Sun Yat-sen Museum tells story of Dr Sun's first wife, Lu Muzhen (with photos)". Available online: https://www.info.gov.hk/gia/general/201204/20/P201204200485.htm. See for some rare photographs also Liu Jushang 劉居上: "Lu taifuren Muzhen shilüe" 盧太夫人慕貞事略 (Biographical sketch of Madame Lu Muzhen). In: *RC/Wenhua zazhi* 文化雜志 No. 81, 2011, pp. 1-21.

education to her children during the years of "exile" in Hawai'i,[43] caused by Sun Yat-sen's revolutionary activities since 1895. Later on, she was also active in church affairs, a regular reader of the Bible, and did not fully fit the image of the "uneducated housewife" often used to describe her. (This is also interesting in contrast to Sun's elder brother Sun Mei's wife Madame Tam (Tan 譚) who apparently was illiterate, which however did not hamper her ability in managing family finances[44] – a reminder that one should double-think quick "labels".)

On a side note, it is also often stated that Lu Muzhen had bound feet, another of the "typical" attributes of "old-style" women. Her mother-in-law Madame Yang and some (not all) other women in the Sun household clearly had, as documented by photographs. Sun Mei's wife Madame Tam, for one, however, had no bound feet to enable her working in the fields (as Hakka/Kejia 客家 women do). On the few photographs showing Lu Muzhen's feet/shoes (since photographs at the time often cropped the lower part), it seems her feet were not particularly small or typically pointed, and she was wearing Western-style leather shoes. But later generations of the Suns, i.a. of Sun Mei's, maintain she had bound feet – to which there were, in any case, also varying degrees –, and this is also mentioned in her autobiographical letter on Sun and herself (if authentic). The issue is of some relevance since it indirectly involves the sensitive question of being Hakka ("guest people") or not, the Hakka being a culturally and linguistically distinct Han-group looked down upon by others, and at the time of Sun Yat-sen's birth in repeated armed conflict with the Cantonese Punti (bendi 本地 "locals"), resulting in a large number of deaths.[45] As Sun Mei's son's eldest grandson, Victor Sun, maintains, they all were not Hakka but Punti, and also all speaking Cantonese, not Hakka.[46] Sun Yat-sen's son Sun Fo, though, had endorsed the version of Hakka scholar Lo Hsiang-lin (Luo Xianglin 羅香林) suggesting that the Suns had Hakka origins,[47] and he even once headed the Worldwide Hakka Federation.[48] Sun Yat-sen himself tried to insinuate to an English-language readership with the foot-binding issue so appalling to Westerners, that he was not only against it, but also that he was no Hakka himself. According to Sun, his mother (Madame Yang) was using foot-binding for drawing the line towards the Hakka to argue in favour of it in the case of Sun's sister Sun Miaoxi 孫妙茜 when he protested on her behalf, seeing her pains. At the same time, this is presented as his earliest attempt at "revolution" – obviously with a subject Westerners would easily sympathise with.[49] One might, though, wonder that given Madame Tam had no bound feet, why this, then, should have been acceptable for mother Yang in the case of

[43] See Sun Fo's recollection: Sun Ke 孫科: *Bashi shulüe* 八十述略 (Brief autobiography at eighty), Taipei 1971, p. 3. (This booklet contains some rare photographs.)
[44] Cf. Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012, chapter 4), Madame Tam's great-grandson.
[45] Cf. the so-called Punti-Hakka wars of the 1850s-1860s. One may recall that the Taiping 太平 movement which caused an enormous upheaval and large-scale destructions in Southern China at that time, had a Hakka background and turned on much of what the Punti considered essential to their cultural and religious identity. This added to rivalry on the economic front.
[46] See Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012), chapter 1. For the earlier generations, he bases this mainly on information received from his father and uncle.
[47] For Sun Fo's endorsement of Luo's work, see Sun Ke: *Bashi shulüe* 1971, p. 1.
[48] See Mary S. Erbaugh: "The Hakka Paradox in the People's Republic of China". In: Nicole Constable (ed.*): Guest People: Hakka Identity in China and Abroad,* Seattle and London: University of Washington Press 1996, pp. 196-231, there pp. 213-215.
[49] See Sun's Western propagandist and biographer Linebarger (*Sun Yat Sen* 1925), p. 81, who was apparently particularly interested in the topic and queried Sun.

choosing the wife in 1877 for her elder son Sun Mei: in the end the most important choice for Chinese parents. As has been suggested already above, Sun's statements were repeatedly more target-oriented than factually reliable. In linguistic terms, in any case, he is reported to have spoken Hakka as well as Cantonese,[50] and it is well known from linguistic as well as anthropological studies that many Hakka were (if by necessity) multi-lingual. For his revolutionary endeavours it was, in the end, financially decisive not to lose Punti backing, and he clearly tapped into both "networks" during his revolutionary career. And in spite of an often claimed "razor-sharp" line between Hakka and Punti in people's heads, cases of intermarriage and mixed descent did exist. Either way, Sun divorced "bound-footed" Lu Muzhen in 1915 (after his brother Sun Mei's death)[51] to marry "modern" and "educated" young Soong Ching-ling (whose father, incidentally, was a born Hakka: see below for the Soongs). Due to the divorce, Lu Muzhen thus was not present at Sun's death and burial. And she would visit his Nanking mausoleum only years later after the Sino-Japanese War.[52]

In terms of closer "family", beyond Lu Muzhen, there were the children of the couple: their son Sun Fo, and their two daughters of whom, however, only one, Sun Wan 孫婉,[53] was still alive at father Sun Yat-sen's death. The elder daughter Sun Yan 孫娫 had fallen ill during her studies in the U.S. and returned in 1913 to her mother Lu Muzhen, then in Macau, while her busy father, with whom the children had rarely ever lived together, would only briefly stop by for a last encounter. Sun Yan soon died and was buried in Macau – her father being absent.[54] Her tomb would be shifted years later in 1931 to the Sun family graveyard in Sun's native Guangdong village Cuiheng when the KMT promoted a stepped-up memorialisation of Sun and his larger family. The younger daughter Sun Wan, in turn, was married already the second time at the point of Sun Yat-sen's death – since he had pressured her to dissolve the first marriage (see below). At Sun Yat-sen's death, she thus was to be formally counted into her then-husband's Dai 戴 family.[55] However, Sun Wan's second husband Tai Ensai (Dai Ensai 戴恩賽), a KMT member, was involved to some degree at least in Sun Yat-sen's death and funeral as one of the testimonies of Sun's official last will.

---

[50] Cf. linguist Erbaugh: "The Hakka Paradox", p. 214.

[51] See Chen Xiqi 陳錫祺 (ed.): *Sun Zhongshan nianpu changbian* 孫中山年譜長編 (Long version of Sun Zhongshan's annalistic biography), Beijing: Zhonghua shuju 1991, vol. 1, p. 936, p. 955, p. 960. Lu Muzhen thus depended from then on mostly on her son Sun Fo. The presentation Sun Yat-sen's propagandistic biographer, Paul Linebarger, gives as to Lu Muzhen asking for the divorce on her own, and lonely left-behind Sun happening to meet Soong Ching-ling thereafter, is clearly a version made up for Western readers, telling more about Sun (and probably Ching-ling) than facts. (Linebarger himself states he made sure with "a member of the Sun family" this "delicate" chapter toed the line: see his *Sun Yat Sen* 1925, p. xi and pp. 354-355.)

[52] See the rare photo of Lu Muzhen in a sedan chair at Sun's Nanking mausoleum in 1946 in the illustration section of Zhou Daochun 周道纯: *Zhongshan lingyuan boji* 中山陵园博记 (A history of the Zhongshan tomb park), Nanjing: Jiangsu renmin chubanshe 1989.

[53] One may note that Sun Fo used alternate names for his sisters in his autobiography: Jinyan 金琰 and Jinwan 金琬. See Sun Ke: *Bashi shulüe* 1971, p. 1.

[54] Notably, Sun Yat-sen even declined to care for a wreath when the betrothed boy-friend asked him to put one in his name on her tomb later, suggesting in a preserved letter he should rather bother his nephew "A Chang" 阿昌 [Sun Chong] instead. (Cf. Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 60.)

[55] For a biographical sketch of Sun Wan and her two marriages with children, see Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002), pp. 233-278. Since the author based his account mainly on interviews with the son of her first marriage, Wang Hongzhi 王弘之, who was the only one living in the PRC, this bias has to be reckoned in.

Sun Yat-sen, however, not only had this one "original" family. While in Japan, he had courted a very young Japanese girl, Ōtsuki Kaoru 大月薫, whom he took as wife in 1903, when she reached a marriageable age, and who is (like other Japanese liaisons of Sun) usually omitted in Chinese accounts, without seeking a divorce from Lu Muzhen first.[56] (This suggests that his later divorce from Lu Muzhen before the marriage with his last wife Soong Ching-ling was only out of consideration of the latter's Methodist parents to present himself to them as formally monogamous.)[57] When Ōtsuki Kaoru became pregnant, Sun went his own way and never met her again, let alone the daughter born, though Sun would return to Japan also later. The daughter was given away, while young Ōtsuki Kaoru remarried, lived and died in Japan.[58]

Furthermore, there was his long-term "revolutionary companion" Chen Cuifen 陳粹芬,[59] born in Hong Kong and with no bound feet,[60] whom he had met in a Protestant Church in Hong Kong when he was still studying medicine there. She was connected to Sun since around 1891, moved with him to Macau (where he briefly practiced medicine and where she apparently already met Lu Muzhen for the first time), and then to Canton. After the 1895 failed uprising there, she accompanied him to Japan where she cared for and endeared herself to many Chinese revolutionaries, including Chiang Kai-shek, and then to Southeast Asia, where Sun Yat-sen was increasingly active in the years 1906 to 1910.[61] After Sun's mother, Madame Yang's death (see below) in 1910 in Hong Kong, when Lu Muzhen and the daughters travelled after Sun to Penang, Chen Cuifen, who was considered "Sun's wife" in Southeast Asia, stayed with them. Sun, in fact, called Lu Muzhen and Chen Cuifen "two mothers" in a Chinese letter of late 1910 to his daughters (to whom he otherwise often wrote in English).[62] Chen Cuifen also moved back to China after the successful revolution, though Sun, now provisional president of the

[56] It is not clear in which way this marriage was exactly "formalised".

[57] As can be seen from letters from Soong Ching-ling's father Charlie Soong to Sun Yat-sen, held in Japan and made known in China by historian Yang Tianshi, Charlie stressed his daughters were never to marry someone having a wife already. (Yang Tianshi 杨天石: "Song Jiashu yu Sun Zhongshan, Song Qingling de hunyin: Du Song Jiashu fu Sun Zhongshan yingwen han" 宋嘉树与孙中山，宋庆龄的婚姻。读宋嘉树复孙中山英文函 (Song Jiashu and the marriage of Sun Yat-sen and Soong Ching-ling: Reading Song Jiashu's English letters in reply to Sun Yat-sen), in: *Bainianchao* 百年潮 ("Hundred Year Tide") 2001, no. 12, pp. 61-66.)

[58] Notably, the otherwise quite detailed book for general readers (Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002) on "the Suns" leaves out the Japanese wife altogether, probably since it was based to a large extent on oral history with Sun's relatives living in or visiting the mainland. Also Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012) does not mention any of the Japanese liaisons of Sun Yat-sen. For more on Ōtsuki Kaoru and their common daughter, see Japanese Sun Yat-sen scholar Kubota Bunji 久保田文次: *Son Bun, Shingai kakumei to nihonjin* 孫文、辛亥革命と日本人 (Sun Yat-sen, the Xinhai revolution and the Japanese), Tokyo: Kyuko shoin 2011, pp. 595-636. In Japan, the daughter was later invited to the Kōbe Sun memorial for commemoration of her biological father.

[59] Biographical sketches of Chen Cuifen can be found, e.g., in Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002) and in Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012), her grandson (Appendix 1: "My Grandmother Ah Tai/Chen Cuifen"). Victor Sun (preface) vividly recalled his "nanny" Chen Cuifen from the years of his childhood and based parts of his narrative on her accounts; see also his Appendix 1.

[60] This can be clearly seen from photographs. She lived with Sun in Tuen Mun /Tunmen 屯門 (see Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 89-90), an area in Hong Kong with many Hakka. (For a photo showing her feet, see, e.g., there p. 101.) Apparently, Sun told her he was to be a new Hong Xiuquan 洪秀全, the Hakka leader of the Taiping movement, which suggests she might have been a Hakka, and she also participated in revolutionary activities herself, very much fitting the common image of Hakka women. (Cf. Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 90, who, however, never calls her a Hakka. Her purported ancestral home near Xiamen is also not in a "typical" Hakka area.)

[61] See Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002), p. 96.

[62] The letter is reproduced in Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002), p. 109.

Republic, did not care for her any longer. He was in the meantime more interested in his new English secretary Soong Ai-ling, Ching-ling's elder sister. Chen Cuifen, too, was taken in for some time by Sun's elder brother Sun Mei, who acknowledged her as part of the Sun family in spite of Sun Yat-sen having abandoned her.[63] She thus lived with Sun Mei's family and Lu Muzhen in the Macau home after the breakup, before moving back to Southeast Asia in 1914 where she tried to earn a living and adopted an overseas Chinese girl, giving her the surname "Sun" to claim her relation to the Suns, since she had no children with Sun herself.

Some years after Sun Yat-sen's death, when her business attempts in Southeast Asia had failed, Chen Cuifen came back to join the family of Sun's son Sun Fo (then the eldest male in the larger Sun family) in Canton, and years later, her adopted daughter would intermarry with the descendants of Sun Mei.[64] That way, beyond being Sun Yat-sen's long-term "revolutionary companion", Chen Cuifen became also linked to the Suns as the maternal grandmother – over her adopted daughter – of Sun Mei's great-grandchildren. Since she had lived repeatedly with Sun Mei's family who had also taken in Sun Yat-sen's primary family for years, she was in the end also integrated in death in the Sun family graveyard near Cuiheng, thus acknowledging her as part of the family. She had lived her final years in Hong Kong where she died in 1962.[65] At first, she was buried close to her adopted daughter who had predeceased her in 1958, in Hong Kong's Tsuen Wan Chinese Permanent Cemetery (荃灣華人永遠墳場). In 1986, when several members of the Sun family accepted the invitation of the PRC to attend the festivities of Sun's 120th birthday, which was used to build a bridge to the formerly attacked "bourgeois" Suns overseas, it was decided to rebury her together with her adopted daughter in the mainland Sun family tomb area in Cuiheng. This was realised thereafter, and in this context, Chen Cuifen was also officially integrated into the Sun family, acknowledging her as de facto Sun Yat-sen's "second wife".[66]

Finally, there was, of course, Sun Yat-sen's last wife, the Methodist Soong Ching-ling (see below for the Soongs), for whom he divorced, as mentioned, his first wife Lu Muzhen. At this point, i.e. in late 1915, Sun was already a grandfather himself by his married son Sun Fo, his last wife Soong Ching-ling being younger than his son. This last marriage of Sun Yat-sen created a huge scandal at the time and put the new couple at odds with many long-term friends,

---

[63] See Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002), p. 98.

[64] According to Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 100), this intermarriage was against the Sun family's wish, especially against Lu Muzhen's. Sun Fo as the highest ranking male of the Suns arranged for a mediation to have them married nevertheless in Italy with Chen Cuifen's adopted daughter dropping the surname Sun (and thus formally cancelling her adoptive relationship to Chen Cuifen), going back to her original surname "Su" 蘇 – since marriages between people of the same surname are deemed inappropriate. This daughter would beget Victor Sun and his siblings.

[65] In 1938 when Canton was attacked by the Japanese during the war, Chen Cuifen moved to Hong Kong where her "daughter's" family joined her, until the Japanese attack on Hong Kong in 1941 caused them to move again. After the Sino-Japanese War, she lived again in Canton and after 1949 moved to Hong Kong again with her "daughter's" family. See Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012), Appendix 1. The dating of her death as "1960" in Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002) is obviously not correct, since Victor Sun lived with her at the time and was present at her death. For events after 1949 and outside of the PRC, Victor Sun is likely the more reliable source.

[66] See Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, Appendix 1/ "My Grandmother Ah Tai, Chen Cuifen". The Suns participating in that event of the 120th birthday included the four daughters of Sun Fo (see below) and the descendants of Sun Mei.

Chinese as well as foreign, the latter including missionaries. This apparently also effectively ended the closer relation of both Sun and the Methodist-raised Soong Ching-ling with the church, which additionally explains why Sun's Soong in-laws took pains to explain the reasons for a Christian funeral ceremony for him also to Westerners in 1925.

In any case, whoever of "Sun's family" had to arrange for themselves for burial,[67] and if they died after 1949, the political split between the by-now Communist mainland China and anti-Communist KMT-led Taiwan (with colonial Hong Kong and Macau, South East Asia or North America as additional alternatives) impacted on the range of options.

Sun Yat-sen's son Sun Fo, for one, would experience this closely. He did not get along too well with his father's de facto successor and later president on Taiwan, Chiang Kai-shek, who in his view "monopolised" his father's legacy, and interpreted it in ways he did not approve of. In the complicated family web between the brothers-in-law of his father via the latter's last wife Soong Ching-ling, including not only Chiang Kai-shek, but also T.V. Soong and H.H. Kung, who were all active players in politics (and had had a hand in his father's burial), Sun Fo was in no comfortable position. His status as Sun's son, though, protected him personally in spite of repeated clashes of opinion and his several changes in alliances, which earned him the nickname "iron neck" for being able to keep his head and survive it all. During the early phase of the Sino-Japanese War, he was useful to Chiang as a matchmaker with the Soviet Union, banking on Sun Yat-sen's cooperation policy with the Soviets in his last years, since China desperately needed airplanes to stand up against the Japanese air force. Before Pearl Harbor, the U.S. were hesitant to get involved too deeply in the conflict, though they agreed to the officially private initiative of the "Flying Tigers" under Claire Chennault, formerly serving at the U.S. air force.[68] But Stalin was ready to provide airplanes to Chiang in significant numbers, if clandestinely, against the Japanese who were the Soviets' rival in East Asia, before the Soviet Union was attacked herself by Hitler and needed the air planes otherwise.

After the Sino-Japanese War, when Sun Fo pressed for a transition to a constitutional government according to his father's ideas and criticised Chiang's continued dictatorship, he, however, ended up being pitted against both Chiang and the Communists by 1949. As a key KMT figure with various political functions,[69] the Communists put Sun Fo on their public black-list of late 1948. This name list of "war criminals", headed by Chiang Kai-shek, but also including Sun Fo and Soong May-ling (the only woman), as well as T.V. Soong and H.H. Kung plus many others, was a clear hint as to who would have to leave the mainland in time.

[67] Although there is no rule to "common" burial, in many cases the wife is buried at the side of her husband, and there are no few cases where whole (patrilineal) families stayed together in death, especially in South China, with strictly hierarchically ranked placements according to birth sequence and gender.
[68] The "Flying Tigers", though, became publicised in the U.S. thereafter on a larger scale by a Hollywood movie starring John Wayne.
[69] His most long-standing function was President of the Legislative Yuan 1932-1948.

Otherwise, they were threatened to be killed "by the people".[70] Sun Fo therefore opted for a "middle ground" by moving to Hong Kong at first, whereto he also invited his mother Lu Muzhen for some time, to then move on to the U.S. where he had already lived many years in his youth, leading a rather secluded and simple, but financially precarious, life. He finally made up with Chiang to move to Taiwan in 1965 to take up honorary positions there,[71] using the 100th birthday of his father (born 1866) as a bridge (which was celebrated in Taiwan according to traditional reckoning in 1965 already). Chiang, in turn, was very eager at this point to bolster his own legitimacy as Sun Yat-sen's political "heir" by inviting Sun's closer relatives to Taiwan. Sun Fo thus ended his days in Taipei (Taibei) in 1973 and is buried there.

Sun Fo's burial was not an easy affair either. Above all, this had to do with his private life, though politics played a role, too. First of all, a problem was created by the fact that beyond his four legal children with Chen Suk-ying (Chen Shuying 陳淑英), daughter of a cousin of Sun Yat-sen, whom he had married in 1912 in Honolulu,[72] he had also fathered two daughters out of wedlock in the 1930s. As for his wife Chen Suk-ying, she was an active KMT member in her own right.[73] When Sun Fo took his sisters Sun Yan and Sun Wan with him to the U.S. in 1912 on orders of Sun Yat-sen for study, he stopped in Honolulu for the marriage, and Chen Suk-ying accompanied him to California, where they were to study.[74] The background to this was a government scholarship provided by Yuan Shikai 袁世凱 to, i.a., Sun's son Sun Fo. This made Sun Yat-sen ask Yuan to provide one also for his two daughters and Sun Fo's bride, which was granted. (Such deals of Sun with his soon-to-be key "enemy" were, unsurprisingly, edited out of later KMT accounts.)[75] When Chen Suk-ying had given birth to their first son in 1913 and to the second in 1915, she had to stop her own studies while Sun Fo finished, and the young family moved back to China in 1917. Two daughters would be born to the couple subsequently in the 1920s. Chen Suk-ying – certainly not fitting the cliché of the "uneducated

[70] This was a clear hint, that the door to further peace talks was closed by that time. See *Renmin ribao* 人民日报 (People's Daily), Dec. 27, 1948: "Shanbei mou quanwei renshi tan zhanfan mingdan wenti" 陕北某权威人士谈战犯名单问题 (Important people in northern Shanxi discuss the problem of a list of war criminals).

[71] As it seems, Sun Fo who had hesitated to throw in his lot with Chiang in 1949 (when his mother Lu Muzhen was still living in Macau) and thus stayed in colonial Hong Kong at first, encountered difficulties in securing a long-term basis of living in the U.S. when he moved there. He thus voiced his interest in moving to Taiwan in the 1960s, provided he was reinstalled there in some nominal position. Sun Yat-sen's 100th birthday celebration was used as a convenient bridge for preparing his shift. (Cf. Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 203-221, and Sun Fo's primarily politically interested biography by a mainland scholar: Gao Hua 高華: *Duobian de Sun Ke: Lishi xuejia Gao Hua bixia de Sun Zhongshan zhi zi* 多變的孫科。歷史學家高華筆下的孫中山之子 (The ever changing Sun Fo: Sun Yat-sen's son as seen by historian Gao Hua), Xianggang: Xianggang zhonghe chubanshe 2012, p. 190.) Sun Fo's own autobiographical account at eighty (Sun Ke: *Bashi shulüe* 1971) is clearly written to please Chiang, with several photographs together and repeated reverential references to him.

[72] See Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012), Appendix 1.

[73] Chen Suk-ying, nevertheless, has received one of the poorest biographical treatments. (For a short one, see Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 222-224.) Taiwanese scholar Zhuang Zheng interviewed her in Taipei in her last years, though.

[74] See the letters of Sun Fo to his cousin Sun Chong, reproduced in Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012), Appendix 1/Granduncle Sun Fo. For a rare photo of the newly wed couple with the two sisters, see the photograph section in Su Ke: *Bashi shilüe* 1971.

[75] Cf. Kubota Bunji (*Son Bun* 2011), p. 441, who stresses that Sun's materials were "selectively" transmitted later by the KMT, e.g. leaving out such "personal favours" Sun requested from Yuan.

housewife" –[76] and the children would largely remain in the south thereafter where Sun Fo mostly served in the 1920s, i.a. as mayor of Canton, and where the children went to school, also occasionally looking after Sun Fo's mother Lu Muzhen in near-by Macau.[77]

In the 1930s, though, Sun Fo was mostly on duty in Shanghai and Nanking and thus moved. In 1936, a daughter, Lily Sui-fong Sun (Sun Suifang 孫穗芳), was born to Sun Fo's secretary Yan Aijuan 嚴藹娟 in Shanghai. Yan Aijuan would ask for years to get sufficient alimentation from him, since he had already dropped her during pregnancy, and she thus had to marry otherwise, taking the girl along. When they all settled for Hong Kong after 1949, she even sued him in court, causing scandal. The daughter, Lily, would only be able to meet her progenitor as a grown-up after a reportedly traumatic childhood and youth in her mother's new family, and would become active in collecting materials of Sun Yat-sen, claiming her "blood relationship" with her famous grandfather who was long dead when she was born.[78] She helped set up the Hong Kong Dr Sun Yat-sen Museum, and became an active Buddhist. At her biological father Sun Fo's death, she thus supplemented his Christian burial rites (since he, too, was baptised) with "Chinese traditional" ones on her own. Sun Fo's eldest son had built the bridge for her in the 1960s to be accepted belatedly into the family, and thus she could also take part in Sun Fo's funeral in 1973 in Taipei.[79]

While Lily was not yet born, Sun Fo started a further, longer-standing relationship with the famous, independent and well-to-do Shanghai beauty Lan Ni 藍妮 of ethnic Miao 苗 origin. Lan Ni, too, was officially ignored by Sun Fo's legal family, as was their daughter Nora Sun (Sun Suifen 孫穗芬),[80] born in 1937, who first met her father after the Sino-Japanese war, even staying some time with him in Nanking. She became a cause célèbre of sorts as a child because she was kidnapped once for a substantial ransom in Shanghai, which was duly paid.[81] On top of this, Lan Ni who had at first moved with Sun Fo to Chungking (Chongqing) when the KMT relocated its capital there during the Sino-Japanese War, decided to go back during the war to occupied Shanghai, since Sun Fo's legal family moved to Chungking, too, when Canton was

[76] She once also posed for advertising "patriotic" beauty products in Hong Kong which created a stir. (See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 223.)
[77] Cf. Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 290.
[78] Lily Sui-fong Sun (Sun Suifang 孫穗芳) published, i.a., a book on "my grandfather Sun Yat-sen" (*Wode zufu Sun Zhongshan* 我的祖父孙中山, Nanjing: Nanjing daxue chubanshe 2011, [first written in 1994]). See also her website dedicated to Sun Yat-sen: http://www.sinofather.org/index.php?s=/Index/category/cid/3/p/14.html. In spite of her frequent returns to the mainland (where she had lived until 1959) since the 1980s, at the centenary of the Xinhai 辛亥 Revolution in 2011, Lily Sun became outspoken against what she saw as a "distortion" of Sun Yat-sen's legacy by the CCP. See "Sun Yat-sen's Granddaughter Criticizes Chinese Regime for Distortion" on NTDTelevision (a Falungong 法輪功 channel based in New York which is, needless to say, banned in mainland China). Video available online: https://www.dailymotion.com/video/xlh88j.
[79] See her autobiographical appendix to the book *Wode zufu* (2011), pp. 221-235.
[80] Apparently, only Sun Fo's mother Lu Muzhen was non-discriminatory towards all of her grand-children (as both of the extramarital daughters claimed).
[81] For biographical sketches of Lan Ni and Nora, see Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 279-382, who interviewed them in Shanghai after their return to the mainland. Nora Sun (Sun Suifang 孫穗芳) became a successful businesswoman and Chinese American diplomat in her own right until she died in a car accident on Taiwan in 2011.

about to be taken by the Japanese. After the Sino-Japanese war, Lan Ni was accused of collaboration with the Japanese and, above all, the Chinese "puppet regime" during those years, and was incarcerated. Sun Fo helped her get out of jail,[82] but all this private-political mix led to scandal and hampered his career thereafter. Like Sun Fo's four legal children, the two extramarital daughters also mostly lived in the U.S. later.[83] At Sun Fo's funeral in Taipei, apparently none of the women with whom he had sired children was present,[84] and of the six children he fathered, not all were welcome.[85] Lan Ni who was never invited to Taiwan, probably because of her "political problem", in spite of daughter Nora's marrying a Taiwanese, stayed for a long time in the U.S. with Nora, to finally move back in 1986 to Shanghai where she was welcomed back by then, her "problematic" past notwithstanding. There she died and was buried in 1996. Chen Suk-ying, in turn, would be buried at Sun Fo's side as his legal wife at her own demise in 1990 in Taipei.

While Sun Fo's case had not been easy, neither was the one of his only surviving sister, Sun Wan. Born in 1896 as the second daughter of Sun Yat-sen and Lu Muzhen during the early times of the Sun family's "exile" in Hawai'i and thus the only one of the children born not in China but in Hawai'i – her father being on the move again at the time of her birth, she had hardly ever lived together with him.[86] He, however, objected to her first husband Wang Boqiu 王伯秋 (whom he had indirectly introduced to her earlier)[87] after it turned out at the couple's return to China in 1919 that Wang had been married already and was not ready to divorce his first wife, as Sun had done with Sun Wan's mother Lu Muzhen.[88] This meant for Sun Wan, who had married Wang Boqiu in 1914 in the U.S., to give up her two little children, born in the U.S. and whose names had been chosen by Sun Yat-sen himself, to the Wang family,[89] for which she reportedly resented her father ever since.

Sun Wan's second husband from Hong Kong, Tai Ensai (Dai Ensai), again a KMT man as was her first husband, met with some opposition, too, this time from her mother Lu Muzhen,

[82] See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 300-301.

[83] Sun Fo's two sons would move to Taiwan subsequently, but had a public fall-out over family finances. (See the short biographies of Sun Fo's legal children in Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 224-232.) Both extramarital daughters were courted by the PRC at several occasion as "family representatives" of Sun Yat-sen as long as the "main" targets were unavailable. Nora had lived for a longer time in Taiwan earlier and then moved to the mainland as a U.S. citizen.

[84] Chen Suk-ying apparently stayed in hospital at the time. Lily's mother was out of question after the law-suits, and Lan Ni, Nora's mother, was not invited.

[85] Nora complained she was rejected by Sun Fo's sons at the funeral. (See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 379).

[86] In fact, she had only met him in Hawai'i during his 1903/04 visit there, then in 1910 in Penang, and finally in Nanking after the Revolution, until he sent her and her siblings to the U.S. for study.

[87] When the elder daughter of Sun Yat-sen, Sun Yan, fell ill during her studies in the U.S. and had to go back, the younger daughter was left alone, and thus Sun Yat-sen asked Wang Boqiu, 12 years her senior, a KMT member whom he knew from Japan and who then studied in the U.S., too, to look after her. (It might be noted that pieces of correspondence of Sun and his children demonstrate that they mostly wrote each other in English.)

[88] Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002 (pp. 233-278) provides a sketch of Sun Wan, mainly drawn from interviews with the son of this first marriage, Wang Hongzhi 王弘之, who was, as mentioned, the only one to remain on the mainland after 1949 while his sister had moved to Taiwan.

[89] Wang Hongzhi claimed his real background was withheld from him until it turned into a political liability during PRC times, though his Wang "bourgeois" family background was an additional liability.

according to Victor Sun, Sun Mei's descendant, for being a Hakka.[90] Nevertheless, this marriage was held in 1921 at Lu Muzhen's home in Macau in the end, i.e. untypically at the bride's and not at the bridegroom's home,[91] with Sun Yat-sen (now married to Soong Ching-ling) not participating but leaving the organisation to his son Sun Fo. Sun Wan who had two children also with her second husband, first lost her son Dai Yongfeng 戴永豐 – the only one of the family to stay on in mainland China after 1949 since he wanted to go on with his studies in Canton's Lingnan 嶺南 University. During the mainland's "Five Anti"-campaign of 1952 directed against the "bourgeoisie",[92] his death was reported in early 1952, i.e. even before his grandmother Lu Muzhen who died later that same year in Macau, and he was buried at Lingnan University in Canton, obviously without any family participation being possible. Following this shock, his father Tai Ensai suffered a break-down and died after prolonged illness in Macau in 1955, leaving Sun Wan and their unmarried daughter Dai Chenggong 戴成功 behind. Still, Sun Wan would not follow Chiang Kai-shek's invitation thereafter to move to Taiwan as a widow to represent the Suns there, given that brother Sun Fo was not yet in harmony with Chiang. She rather opted for remaining in Macau, cared for by her daughter, and died there in 1979 where she was also buried as her mother Lu Muzhen and her husband Tai Ensai.[93] Her burial was turned into a rather high-profile event, being presided over by Ho Yin (He Xian 何賢), the key Chinese leader in Macau with good ties to Peking. Subsequently, she was moved to the Dai family tomb in Hong Kong's Chinese Protestant Pokfulam (Bofulin 薄扶林) Cemetery, to be buried together with Tai Ensai there – which suggests the whole Dai family was Protestant, too,[94] as many Hakka were.[95]

In sum, both of Sun Yat-sen's surviving children were not buried in by-then Communist mainland China when they died in the 1970s, and of his siblings, only his early widowed elder sister Sun Miaoxi 孫妙茜 lived into the 1950s who remained at their mainland native place to look after the Sun family house (now preserved as a memorial) in Cuiheng.[96] Sun Miaoxi was

[90] This, at least, is claimed by Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, chapter 1, having it heard from his father and uncle present at the time. Victor Sun concludes that this is a circumstantial evidence that they were all not of Hakka origin themselves.

[91] Lu Muzhen's home intends today's Dr Sun Yat-sen Memorial House. For a photograph taken at the wedding, see "Sun Wan Dai Ensai hunli heying li de gushi" 孙琬戴恩赛婚礼合影里的故事 (The story behind the [family] photo at the marriage of Sun Wan and Tai Ensai), March 27, 2014, available online: http://dangshi.people.com.cn/n/2014/0327/c85037-24754608.html. The article's text, however, contains a few factual errors. In 2015, the Hong Kong Dr Sun Yat-sen Museum did an exhibition on Sun Wan and Tai Ensai. See: https://www.lcsd.gov.hk/CE/Museum/sysm/zh_TW/web/sysm/exhibition/pastexhibitions/past_exh_sun_wan.html. It should be noted that the family letters between Sun Wan and Tai Ensai, too, were written in English, as the exhibition made clear.

[92] Cf. Theodore Hsi-En Chen and Wen-Hui C. Chen: "The 'Three-Anti' and 'Five-Anti' Movements in Communist China". In: *Pacific Affairs* vol. 26, no. 1, 1953, pp. 3-23.

[93] Dai Chenggong lived on in Macau until her death in 1991. (See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002 p. 277).

[94] See "Sun Zhongsan nüxu Dai Ensai shi 'kejia' ren" 孫中山女婿戴恩賽是「客家」人 (Sun Yatsen's son-in-law Tai Ensai was a 'Hakka'), Sept. 11, 2011, available online: http://www.christianweekly.net/2011/ta23319.htm.

[95] In fact, the Basel Evangelical Missionary Society concentrated their evangelising efforts on Hakka in Guangdong. Cf. Nicole Constable: "Poverty, Piety, and the Past: Hakka Christian Expressions of Hakka Identity". In: Nicole Constable (ed.): *Guest People: Hakka Identity in China and Abroad*, Seattle and London: University of Washington Press 1996, pp. 98-123, there p. 100.

[96] Sun's other siblings had died before him. Sun Miaoxi remained on the mainland after 1949, being in her eighties at the time, and died there in 1955. (There are some brief – if not always accurate – chapters on people of Xiangshan connected to Sun, including some of his relatives like Sun Miaoxi, which contain, however, some rare

buried in the Sun family cemetery set up by the KMT in the 1930s in the Cuiheng area on the land of the Tam (Tan 譚) family connected to the Suns by marriage.[97] The large Macau house where Lu Muzhen had lived, in turn, became the "Dr Sun Yat-sen Memorial House" (a museum and sightseeing spot to this day) under KMT directions in the late 1950s after Lu Muzhen's death. It was the only place in the long run where the Taiwan Chiang government would display its claims in Macau vis-à-vis the neighbouring PRC. (In the context of the Cultural Revolution turmoil which affected also Macau, the display of the R.O.C./Republic of China flag was, however, shifted to the inside to prevent further damage of the large impressive building.)[98] More recently, though, the "Taiwan-connection" of the building was reappraised, using it to garner support from the overseas Chinese community – and for cross-Strait relations.

The political context also influenced the trajectory of the tomb of Lu Muzhen, the mother of Sun's children, who died in Macau in 1952 where she – and her daughter Sun Wan's second family – had mostly lived after Sun had divorced her. In fact, at closer scrutiny, there are several shifts discernible. In 2004, i.e. after Macau's handover to the PRC (1999), Sun's mainland native place Cuiheng, later integrated in what is called in honour of Sun (after his pseudonym) the city of Zhongshan 中山市,[99] "welcomed" dead Lu Muzhen "back". This apparently was in a larger context to use the upcoming 140th anniversary of Sun Yat-sen's birth in 2006 (in the "Western" reckoning used in the PRC) for a large conference to invite the Sun family members from all over the world "back" to China – which included visiting the ancestors' tombs. This high-profile 2006 event hosted by no one less than then-president Hu Jintao 胡锦涛, assured the relatives that finally also the PRC's leaders would not brand the Suns any longer as "bourgeois" and "capitalist", as Sun Mei's descendant Victor Sun remarked.[100] In fact, those connected to Sun Yat-sen that had remained on the mainland after 1949 like the son of Sun's daughter Sun Wan of her first luckless marriage, or Sun Fo's extramarital daughter Lily (who later moved to the U.S.) complained to have only suffered during the Mao years because of

---

photographs: *Sun Zhonshan yu Xiangshan: Sun Zhongshan yanjiu wenji disanji* 孙中山与香山: 孙中山研究文集第三辑 (Sun Yat-sen and Xiangshan: Third collection of Sun Yat-sen research articles), 2001, available online: http://sunzs.elingnan.com/search/read.aspx?id=189).

[97] Sun Mei's wife was, as mentioned, a Tam.

[98] There are some contradictory accounts about Lu Muzhen's addresses in Macau and about the history of the building today called "Dr Sun Yat-sen Memorial House". As some letter envelopes of Sun Yat-sen to Lu Muzhen prove, she had stayed at various locations in Macau before moving to this one in 1918. (Cf. two envelope examples provided in Lau Sin-peng 劉羨冰 (Liu Xianbing): *Xinhai bainian zai sikao* 辛亥百年再思考 (Reflections at the Xinhai 100th anniversary), Aomen: Aomen ligong xueyuan 2012, p. 220. See also the list on Sun-connected places in Macau on p. 233.) The present "Memorial House" had been damaged because of an explosion of a powder magazine nearby in 1930 and was rebuilt with funds from Macau and Sun Fo in Moorish-hybrid style. Because after 1949 Macau kept its relationship with the Chiang Kai-shek government by then on Taiwan, the memorial house displayed the Republican flag. This led to some damage in the late 1960s when the upheavals of the Cultural Revolution of the neighbouring PRC led to turmoil also in Macau. The government of Macau thus decided to take the publicly visible R.O.C. flag off (though it was retained in the inner of the house). (See the brief history of the building provided on spot.) After Lu Muzhen's death, her former driver lived on there until his death in 1995. See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 75.

[99] Zhongshan City took this naming from Sun's Japanese pseudonym Nakayama 中山 already under KMT rule in 1925, by then still as Zhongshan "district" and only in 1983 upgraded to a "city". (See Chen Xiqi: *Sun Zhongshan nianpu changbian* vol. 1, p. 3, note 1.)

[100] Cf. Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, preface, who was proud to have participated in this event.

their "Sun connection".[101] The tragic case of Sun Wan's son of the second marriage, Dai Yongfeng, has been mentioned already. In short, Lu Muzhen's reburial on the mainland should be also seen in this context of "bridging" the historical-political gap. In the PRC reburial, she was placed close to Sun's nephew and son of his elder brother Sun Mei, Sun Chong (Sun Chang 孫昌, see below). This also meant that Lu Muzhen was posthumously (after the Mao-era – and after Soong Ching-ling's death)[102] treated locally (and by the immediate Sun family) as the acknowledged "wife" who "belonged" to the Sun family and thus to the Sun family's tomb area, regardless of the divorce enacted in Japan in 1915.[103]

Politics and family, the public and the private also intersected otherwise with her tomb. Her original tombstone inscription of 1952 in Macau's "Western cemetery" (the São Miguel Arcanjo Cemetery) was by her son, Sun Fo, on whom she depended since the divorce. The delicate question as to how to address Lu Muzhen on her tombstone had been solved by Sun Fo by treating her as "Sun Fo's mother" which was also a way how Sun Yat-sen himself addressed her after the divorce.[104] Since Lu Muzhen was a devout Baptist, her tombstone figured a cross. When her tomb was renovated in 1975 (after Sun Fo's death, but with her daughter Sun Wan still there), it was shifted to Macau's Chinese "permanent cemetery" on Taipa island.[105] In this context, her tomb was notably "upgraded" in nationalist terms with a more elaborate structure and the additional inscription claiming her even as "mother of the nation" (*guomu* 國母) and Sun Yat-sen's "original wife", by this voicing also the KMT version of criticism towards Sun's "change" to "leftist" Soong Ching-ling who then opted for the Communists. Ching-ling was still living in Peking at this point in time. (As might be recalled, the KMT called Sun "father of the nation", and thus she was called "mother of the nation". The CCP "paid back" by calling Soong Ching-ling occasionally *guomu*, too.)[106] The post-handover relocation of Lu Muzhen's tomb to Zhongshan in the PRC, obviously, did not transfer that additional (KMT) part of the Taipa tomb.[107]

---

[101] See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, who interviewed Sun Wan's son, Wang Hongzhi, p. 261, and also Lily claimed harassment because of her family relations. She thus used an occasion in 1959 to leave the mainland for good. See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 399-403.

[102] As Shen Feide (*Sun Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 43) points out, after 1949 it was not possible for a long time to show her photograph in the Sun Yat-sen memorial, writing her out of history to only name Soong Ching-ling as Sun's "wife". This only changed after the Mao-era (and Soong Ching-ling's death).

[103] It seems that her "place" in the Sun family was also secured as a concession by Sun Yat-sen himself to solicit her agreement to the divorce.

[104] Sun's letters to Lu Muzhen after the divorce have been kept locally. Cf. also the website biography already referred to: "Lu Mu-chen (Sun Loo Shee, Lu Muzhen)", 2019, available online: http://www.cityofzhuhai.com/2019-10/31/c_421265.htm. Excerpts of the letters are also cited in Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 68-70 and p. 76. (It should, however, be noted that Sun Mei, too, sometimes wrote letters addressing his wife as "Sun Chong's mother". This might have had also the background that in her case she needed someone to read them out to her.)

[105] This cemetery, Xiao si yongyuan muyuan 孝思永遠墓園, strangely given the additional Portuguese name of "Cemitério Budista" though the place is run by all creeds, was considered the "best" and was only established in 1973 as the most recent of all cemeteries in Macau. (See Liang Jinying 梁錦英 and Xiao Jiming 蕭潔銘: *Aomen fenchang* 澳門墳場 (Macau's cemeteries), Xianggang: Sanlian shudian 2011, pp. 76-79.)

[106] See, e.g., He Husheng: *Babaoshan jishi* vol. 2, chapter 35, dedicated to "*guomu*" Soong Ching-ling.

[107] For photos of the post-handover-relocated grave of Lu Muzhen, see "Zhongshan guji zhi Sun mu Lu taifuren mu" 中山古迹之孙母卢太夫人墓 (Zhongshan historic site: the tomb of Sun [Fo']s mother, Madame Lu), May 28, 2019, available online: https://kuaibao.qq.com/s/20190528A0492000?refer=spider. The tombstone inscription,

Sun Yat-sen's nephew Sun Chong (as he was usually spelt in English), in turn, at whose side Lu Muzhen was reburied in the end, had drowned in 1917 in the Pearl River when helping his uncle whose revolutionary activities he had supported over many years.[108] As mentioned, Sun Chong's father Sun Mei had been the one to care all the time for his much younger brother Sun Yat-sen (and later the latter's family). He had sent Sun Yat-sen to school in Hawai'i while his own apparently only biological son Sun Chong was born.[109] Uncle Sun Yat-sen and nephew Sun Chong thus knew each other closely, as did Lu Muzhen and her children who had mostly lived with Sun Mei's family over the years subsequently. Sun Chong's tomb was first set up close to the point where he had drowned (i.e. in Whampoa/Huangpu 黄埔 downstream from Canton). According to Feng Ziyou 馮自由, a close friend of Sun Chong's father Sun Mei and author of the well-known multi-volume *Geming yishi* 革命逸史 (Unofficial history of the revolution), Sun Chong, whose death circumstances are usually not detailed in later accounts, was actually a victim of friendly fire by error, which added to the tragedy.[110] Sun Chong had married in 1905 in Hawai'i,[111] and had fathered two sons during his studies and work in California affected first by the 1906 San Francisco earthquake which he only nearly survived, then by his father's bankruptcy (see below). After the revolution, Sun Chong had taken his mother Madame Tam and his young family over to join father Sun Mei, but soon not only father Sun Mei died in 1915 in Macau (see below), but his wife, too. Thus, at Sun Chong's sudden death in 1917, the two boys were orphaned and cared for by the larger family, partly by their aging grandmother Madame Tam, Sun Mei's widow, and for some time also by Sun Yat-sen and his last wife Soong Ching-ling in Canton from 1918 on.

The tomb of Sun Chong who had become a Christian shortly before his accidental death in 1917, was shifted from Whampoa to Cuiheng in 1936 by his by now grown-up elder son (together with the remains of the mother, Sun Chong's wife, from Macau).[112] Sun Yat-sen's praise of his nephew, written at Sun Chong's death, was carved in a front slab, and a longer inscription by Sun Fo, his cousin, who was close to him since the Hawai'ian days, on a stele.[113] (This, in turn, would lead to the stele's being attacked during the Cultural Revolution, since

---

though, does not reveal the fact of re-burial. For a photo of the more elaborate pre-relocation tomb in Taipa in Macau shortly before the transfer, see "Sun guomu Lu taifuren zang yu Aomen zi" 孙国母卢太夫人葬于澳门仔 (Mother of the nation Sun, Madame Lu, buried on Taipa, Macau), December 19, 2004, available online: http://www.christianweekly.net/2004/sa9944.htm. See also the website dedicated to Sun Yat-sen by one of the two extramarital daughters of Sun Fo, Lily: http://www.sinofather.org/index.php?s=/Index/category/cid/3/p/14.html.

[108] Sun Chong took part in his uncle's activities already in Japan in 1901, as a photo testifies. (See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 16.) For a letter (in English, as often) to "Ah Chong" by Sun Yat-sen and a photo, see *Sun Zhongshan jinianguan* 2006, p. 65.

[109] Sun Mei would adopt further children in Hawai'i later. There is no evidence that Sun Mei ever took concubines or further wives. However, he apparently had a personal connection to the Hawai'ian royal house in some way since he enjoyed several privileges there.

[110] Feng Ziyou's insider history of the Revolution, providing a biography of Sun Chong's father Sun Mei, states that Sun Chong was actually "shot by error" by marines. See Feng Ziyou 馮自由: *Geming yishi* 革命逸史 (Unofficial history of the revolution), Taibei: Taiwan shangwu yinshuguan 1969, 3rd ed. 1977, vol. 2, p. 9. A version of Sun Chong's death circumstances is also given in Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 35-36).

[111] See Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, chapter 6.

[112] See Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, Appendix 1.

[113] See Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002), p. 36. Sun Chong had married again, but the second wife apparently remarried after his death. Ibid. p. 37.

Sun Fo, as mentioned, was deemed a KMT "war criminal" in the PRC). Sun Fo, though, also cared for cousin Sun Chong's memory later in Taiwan when he discovered that he was at first not integrated in Taipei's new "National Revolutionary Martyrs' Shrine" set up in the late 1960s, possibly due to the embarrassing circumstances of his death. Following Sun Fo's suggestion, Sun Chong's descendants filed an application, and thus he was inscribed in the end as one of those who had lost their lives "for the national revolution".[114]

Different from the former cases, the tomb of Sun Yat-sen's mother, Madame Yang 楊, was, however, not transferred back to Cuiheng but remained in Hong Kong where she had lived her last almost two years and died in 1910. Today, her tomb is monitored by Hong Kong's Antiquities and Monuments Office.[115] Technically speaking, it still is private property, which renders a potential heritagisation process of the tomb in Hong Kong's legal context somewhat complex. The life story of the tomb owner, in any case, was not a very lucky one. While Sun Yat-sen's father had died already in 1888, i.e. before his younger son's revolutionary career, and was buried near Cuiheng, Madame Yang had to dramatically flee the mainland in 1895, due to Sun Yat-sen's first failed revolutionary attempt, which put his whole family (mostly consisting of women) in immediate danger.[116] Together with the other women staying behind in the household (and with bound feet hampering mobility), Madame Yang thus had to leave her home in a hurry, to never return. She fled to Hawai'i to her elder son Sun Mei,[117] together with Lu Muzhen and her children Sun Fo and Sun Yan born by then. In Hawai'i, they would all live for several years quite comfortably, with Sun Yat-sen travelling by only rarely (which resulted in his second daughter Sun Wan being born in late 1896 in Hawai'i),[118] until Sun Mei, on whom all financially depended, became broke.

While Sun Fo remained behind in Hawai'i for work and study, and Sun Mei's illiterate, but obviously very able wife Madame Tam remained, too, to finish the bankruptcy management,[119] Madame Yang travelled with Lu Muzhen and her two daughters (as well as Sun Mei's adopted daughter)[120] in late 1908 to join Sun Mei in Hong Kong. He, by now, tried to build up a new basis for living for them in the British colony. This time, however, they were all in economically dire circumstances, and Madame Yang was at this point additionally hampered

[114] See Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, preface.
[115] Cf. Ella and Stella Lee: "Repair hope for tomb of Sun Yat-sen's mother". In: *South China Morning Post*, May 15, 2000. Available online: https://www.scmp.com/article/316593/repair-hope-tomb-sun-yat-sens-mother.
[116] The Qing went for the families of suspects. Cf. Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002), p. 48 ff., on the narrow escape.
[117] She had been there already in the 1870s, once accompanying little Sun Yat-sen to join his brother in Hawai'i.
[118] According to the Dr. Sun Yat-sen Hawai'i Foundation's website, he visited Hawai'i six times in his life, with his wife and children present, though, only in 1896 and in 1903/04. Available online: http://sunyatsenhawaii.org/category/hawaii-roots/his-six-visits-to-hawaii/.
[119] His bankruptcy of 1906 was legally only finished by 1909. (For the legal procedures of the bankruptcy, see Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, chapter 7). His bankruptcy was attributed to his channelling funds to revolutionary endeavours which even prevented him to help his own son Sun Chong in 1906 who lost his home because of the San Francisco earthquake, just having become a father himself (see above).
[120] Sun Mei, who apparently had only sired Sun Chong, had adopted her for himself and further children in Hawai'i in name of a younger brother who had died as a child to provide him with nominal descendants. (Cf. Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, Appendix 1 / "The Adoptions of Ah Ha, Xi Yin and Awai").

by near blindness.[121] Her death in 1910, i.e. still during Qing times, created a problem since her funeral and burial in Hong Kong's New Territories could only be financed and organised with the help of male family friends, given that none of her sons (or grandsons) was present at the time.[122] Her revolutionary younger son Sun Yat-sen was banned by the British from the colony anyway,[123] and Sun Mei was temporarily away, too. Only after the successful revolution, Madame Yang's tomb could be set up properly by her elder son Sun Mei in 1912. It was renovated several times since,[124] though apparently there was no attempt to move her to the Sun family graveyard near Cuiheng to join her husband, i.e. Sun Yat-sen's father, and the larger Sun family after Hong Kong's handover to the PRC (1997). As mentioned, the tomb is now instead a monitored site of Hong Kong, adding to the city's various links to famous Sun Yat-sen.

Sun Yat-sen's elder brother Sun Mei,[125] finally, who was banned from Hong Kong by the British himself, too (shortly after mother Yang's death), because of his help to the revolutionaries, at first took refuge in French-controlled Guangzhouwan 廣州灣 (now Zhanjiang 湛江), using an alias, though lacking the means to finance the extended family further at this point. He, too, was now on the wanted list (and was only saved from being extradited to the Qing by his U.S. citizenship). Lu Muzhen and her daughters, on their part, thus had to hurry after Sun Yat-sen then in Penang, always under peril as kin of revolutionaries. Sun, however, was soon banned by the British from that colonial territory, too, leaving Lu Muzhen and the daughters (as well as Chen Cuifen) again behind to be sustained by overseas Chinese friends, while their son Sun Fo was still studying in the U.S.

After the successful revolution of 1911/12, Sun Mei could finally return with his family to their natal Cuiheng, while Lu Muzhen and her daughters together with Sun Fo, who had been called back to China, joined Sun Yat-sen, now in Nanking to become provisional president, briefly. At the peak of Sun's career, he, however, did not pay particular attention to his "old-style" family. He took in "modern" and Western-educated Soong Ai-ling as his English secretary whom Lu Muzhen obviously interpreted as a further addition to the family beyond the "revolutionary companion" Chen Cuifen, who had also come back from Penang after the

[121] See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 51, who cites the memoir of Sun Mei's Hong Kong friend to this avail.

[122] The burial slot was bought by friends, as receipts reproduced by Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012, chapter 8) testify. Lu Muzhen and her daughters as well as Sun Chong's aunts were with Madame Yang. Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012, chapter 8) details the complicated events of 1910, showing that Sun Mei by now was a revolutionary himself and thus often on tour. Her grandsons, both Sun Fo and Sun Chong (together with his mother Madame Tam, his wife and the children), were in the U.S. (Honolulu and California respectively) at that time.

[123] See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 26.

[124] For photographs at different points in time, see Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, chapter 8, fig. 113-115.

[125] The most extensive account of Sun Mei is Victor Sun's already referred-to ebook on his great-grandfather (*Sun Mei* 2012). For a PRC biographical account of Sun Mei (leaving out some sensitive aspects), see the website of the Sun Yat-sen memorial at his native place: available online: https://web.archive.org/web/20150610224214/http://www.sunyat-sen.org:1980/b5/125.92.250.161/sun/showqshy.php?id=12. Furthermore, there is the mentioned biography by Feng Ziyou, Sun Mei's friend, in his *Geming yishi* vol. 2, pp. 1-9. A more extensive PRC treatment of Sun Mei is in Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002, pp. 1-34), who takes much of his materials from Sun Mei's grandson, i.e. the elder son of Sun Mei's only son Sun Chong, who visited the mainland in the 1980s and was the uncle of Victor Sun.

revolution. Chen Cuifen, however, was no longer on Sun's mind at this point. Lu Muzhen, in turn, opted for finally returning to the Guangdong home, to which Sun Yat-sen would pay a brief visit only after stepping down from the presidency. Facing the villagers he once upset, he now arrived as a returned stopping-over "V.I.P." with an entourage.

On a side note, a look into the photographs Sun Yat-sen had taken at the time, now no longer a hunted revolutionary, is highly informative. In terms of family, it is remarkable that Soong Ai-ling appeared on several of them, placed in a way to suggest her being integrated into the Sun family hierarchy – although she herself seems not to have interpreted it that way. In fact, there seems to have been done little interpretation of the photographic material in a social history sense thus far in scholarship on Sun, although placement is crucial for interpretation of interpersonal relations beyond the fact of "who is on". Soong Ai-ling repeatedly appeared in 1912/1913, positioned close to Sun and Lu Muzhen and between Lu Muzhen and Sun's daughters, suggesting her to be a second wife, which Sun Yat-sen apparently aimed at, while she put up an often hermetic, if not defiant pose on the photographs. This is remarkable as it were, after all, Sun's best times, and she a young, yet unmarried daughter of a close ally of his (see below for the Soongs) at this point.

Meanwhile, as mentioned, Sun struck a successful deal with his presidential successor Yuan Shikai to send all his children, i.e. Sun Fo but also the two daughters Sun Yan and Sun Wan, to the U.S. for study with government funds.[126] His elder brother Sun Mei who had hoped to be rewarded with the governorship of Guangdong Province for all his services over the years, saw his wishes however frustrated by his younger brother, who soon toured Japan in early 1913 for investigation, being in charge of railway development in China after he had stepped down from the provisional presidency. With the children off to the U.S., Lu Muzhen tried to join him in Japan, but Sun – as noted and even highlighted by the Japanese press of the time which reported in astonishing detail on every move – only dropped by for meeting her for 30 minutes in Ōsaka, before his next appointments kept him busy.[127] Lu Muzhen, instead, was sent on travel with "secretary" Soong Ai-ling and her mother to Tokyo. On the way, they had a car accident, which however did not disturb Sun Yat-sen much – again noted down by the Japanese hosts – and did not change his itinerary.[128] (Soong Ai-ling's father, though, who was with Sun,

[126] This included, as mentioned, also Sun Fo's bride Chen Suk-ying in the end.

[127] This is notably emphasised by the Japanese newspaper typographically. The report also provides a rarely seen close-up photo of Lu Muzhen: see *Ōsaka mainichi shinbun* 大阪毎日新聞 (Osaka daily), March 12, 1913, p. 9: "Son Itsusen no fujin kitaru" 孫逸仙の夫人來る (Sun Yat-sen's wife arrives). Since in many Chinese accounts there is a misunderstanding, apparently due to misinterpretation of the Japanese word *shijō* 侍女 (maid): Sun's three children were at the time in the U.S. and she thus was not in the company of her "daughters", as often interpreted. The "erroneous" interpretation as "daughters" has been popularised, e.g., by *Sun Zhongshan nianpu changbian* vol. 1, p. 784 and pp. 786-787. Obviously, Lu Muzhen had come to Japan to join her husband, but was rather considered a burden by Sun, as becomes clear from his behaviour. For Chinese brief reporting, see *Minlibao* 民立報 (People's journal), March 20, 1913, p. 6. (I am grateful to Mrs. Gumbrecht of the Berlin State Library for providing me with a copy.)

[128] Soong Ai-ling and Lu Muzhen had been hurt, but not gravely. According to Luo Jialun 羅家倫 (ed.): *Guofu nianpu* 國父年譜 (Annalistic biography of the Father of the Nation), Taibei: Zhongguo guomindang zhongyang weiyuan hui dangshi weiyuanhui, enlarged 3rd ed. 1985, vol. 1, pp. 554-555, also the mother of Soong Ai-ling was with them. On the car accident, based on Japanese reports which confirm that Mother Ni was travelling

immediately went off to look after them.) Lu Muzhen then left Japan where Sun continued his meticulously reported tour,[129] and settled with Sun Mei in Macau, together with Chen Cuifen, Sun Yat-sen's "revolutionary companion" of earlier times.[130]

When news broke of KMT would-be premier Song Jiaoren's 宋教仁 assassination (attributed to Yuan Shikai), Sun Yat-sen decided to start the so-called second revolution of 1913 against Yuan Shikai's attempted dictatorship. When it failed, his brother Sun Mei, too, had to avoid the mainland again, where he had in the meantime modernised their old house in Cuiheng (today's Sun Yat-sen memorial there). Consequently, Sun Mei now stayed permanently in Macau, living again with the extended family, including Lu Muzhen, and soon died in 1915, just a little over 60 years old. At first, he had been buried in the "Western Cemetery" of Macau, which intends the São Miguel Arcanjo Cemetery.[131] Years later in 1934, the KMT shifted Sun Mei's remains back to his mainland place of origin, Cuiheng, to honour him for his contributions by upholding the family while his brother was busy with revolutionary activities. Notably, at that time a stele was erected for him with a eulogy written by Wang Jingwei, the then-KMT chairman, which – given Wang's later wartime "career" as a "collaborator" with the Japanese – would become problematic subsequently.[132] The remains of Sun Mei's wife Madame Tam who died in 1938 in the Macau home, too (where in the war years after the Japanese advance into Guangdong, Sun Yat-sen's early widowed sister Sun Miaoxi had also moved to),[133] were shifted to Cuiheng only just before the Communist takeover. This was done by one of Madame Tam's grandsons, though none of her two grandsons would remain on the mainland, given their KMT affiliation.[134]

In summary, in terms of memorial culture with tombs, beyond Sun Yat-sen's own mausoleum in Nanking, of Sun Yat-sen's natal family, his mother Madame Yang's tomb is an officially monitored site of Hong Kong, while his elder brother Sun Mei's tomb is today declared heritage of the mainland province of Guangdong, as is the one of the latter's son Sun Chong. Chen Cuifen's tomb as well as the Sun graveyard as such, located on the Tam family's ground, are

together with Ai-ling and Lu Muzhen, see Kubota (*Son Bun* 2011), pp. 623-624. The event might have cautioned Ai-ling further towards Sun.

[129] *Son Bun sensei tōyū kinen shashin jō* 孫文先生東游紀念写真帖 (Commemorative photo album of Mr. Sun Yat-sen's travel to the East), Kobe: Nikka shinposha 1913.

[130] Cf. Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, Appendix 2.

[131] Cf. Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, Appendix 2, who only calls it "Western cemetery". Given that the other "Western cemetery" Nossa Senhora da Piedade was not yet established, this intends the older São Miguel Arcanjo Cemetery. (Cf. Müller: *Challenging Dead*, p. 7 and p. 9.)

[132] Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012) provides a translation of the Wang Jingwei inscription as well as photos of the tomb. (See his chapter 10).

[133] See Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 74. Thus, some movable cultural heritage of the Suns' Cuiheng home could survive the war there.

[134] Cf. her great-grandson Victor Sun (*Sun Mei* 2012, chapter 3: "Geomancy and ancestral tombs"). The Communist takeover caused the grandsons to leave the mainland, one of them being a civil functionary of the Chiang Kai-shek regime, the other being in the KMT army, but the stone tomb of Madame Tam could be set up only much later in 1987. (See Victor Sun: *Sun Mei* 2012, Appendix 1).

municipal heritage of the city of Zhongshan.[135] Thus, they are all in this sense now belonging to the public. Lu Muzhen's tomb, though, being transferred only in 2004 for the last time, apparently has not yet made it into a heritage listing, but it is the only one still showing (or free to show) the Christian identity of the tomb owner. This, in turn, bewilders modern mainland visitors,[136] who are not accustomed to encounter this with a tomb of "national" relevance.

The Chiangs

Not only the Suns had their "grave problems", though. Also in the case of the Chiangs, their burials were no easy affair. Chiang Kai-shek, who died in 1975 in Taiwan, remained single in death and was not even interred – a key element of finalising death in China, usually captured in the phrase *ru tu wei an* 入土為安 (interment brings peace). This was in accordance with his instruction that one day "after the mainland's liberation from the Communists" he should be buried there, either close to Sun Yat-sen in Nanking where he had reserved himself a place already early on,[137] or in his native soil near his mother – a "mere" concubine of his father not buried together with the latter.[138] That Chiang took burial matters very seriously, is corroborated by his treatment of his mother's tomb over the years, continuously embellishing it, adding an impressive arch on the way leading up, by this "upgrading" her post-mortem.[139] He also used the tomb's larger ground as a place to build a cottage to retire to at crucial moments in his career. The inscriptions and calligraphies of various KMT notables Chiang had solicited after his mother's death in 1921, installed on spot and published as a booklet in 1923 at a time when he was yet to ascend to top positions, included also Wang Jingwei, the later Japanese "puppet" during war-time in Chiang's view. Predictably, Wang Jingwei's inscription was taken off by Chiang immediately when the Japanese had to give up the area and he was able to revisit the tomb after the Sino-Japanese War. In fact, Chiang proved himself repeatedly someone who quite aggressively promoted *damnatio memoriae* measures.

---

[135] See "Lishi yiji – Sun Zhongshan guju jinianguan" 历史遗迹. 孙中山故居纪念馆 (Historical sites: Sun Yat-sen's Former Residence Memorial). Available online: http://www.sunyat-sen.org/index.php?m=content&c=index&a=lists&catid=95.

[136] See the website already referred to: "Zhongshan guji zhi Sun mu Lu taifuren mu", available online: https://kuaibao.qq.com/s/20190528A0492000?refer=spider. The cross on the tombstone prompted the mainland website to "explain" this "unusual tombstone" with the tomb owner's religious faith.

[137] The spot he had chosen was marked with a pavilion. See Wagner: "Ritual, Architecture, Politics, and Publicity during the Republic", p. 266.

[138] Chiang's father who died in 1895 when Chiang was still a child, was finally buried after the establishment of the Republic with his first and second wife, with the key revolutionary figure Huang Xing 黄興 providing the inscription, while Chiang's mother who died 1921 many years after his father, was buried alone. For some photos and brief descriptions of the tombs of his father and his mother, see the popular book by Wang Tiancang 王天苍: *Xikou fengguang* 溪口风光 (Scenery of Xikou), Ningbo: Ningbo chubanshe 2003, pp. 53-57.

[139] More details regarding the repeated embellishment of the tomb of his mother by Chiang can be found in Yang Guoqing: *Minguo mingren mu* 1998, pp. 85-89.

A referral of definite burial – as in the case of Chiang Kai-shek himself – was as such quite common in Chinese tradition. The memorial hall in central Taipei built after his death which alludes to the style of the Sun Yat-sen mausoleum in Nanking,[140] did, however, not become his (if temporary) resting place as in the case of Sun, but his remains still stay on at a former residence of his in Cihu 慈湖 in Taoyuan 桃園 county. To this day, beyond the say of the KMT, the Chiang family members are divided amongst themselves about what to do with his remains. This is not the least because the Chiang-critical DPP governments in Taiwan would like to have him shifted from his temporary mausoleum to a cemetery – and thus, in a way, "normalised" and "put" to eternal rest.[141]

For this, there would be options. E.g., Chiang's adopted younger son Chiang Wei-kuo (Jiang Weiguo 蔣緯國), like Chiang Kai-shek a military man, who died in 1997, is buried in the Wuchih Mountain National Military Model Cemetery (Wuzhishan guojun shifan gongmu 五指山國軍示範公墓 / "Republic of China Military Cemetery") in the outskirts of Taipei. Chiang Wei-kuo himself had reportedly urged to build this cemetery, which was opened in 1982.[142] It modelled itself after the U.S. "national cemetery" of Arlington and was supposed to "host" the military,[143] often "mainlanders" with no original family ties on Taiwan, by now growing old and predictably anxious about the burial issue, given that any "return to the mainland" was clearly illusionary, as well as people who "served the nation" in other outstanding ways. Thus, also former presidents of Taiwan are interred there now, namely Chiang Kai-shek's deputy and immediate successor as president on Taiwan, the civilian politician Yen Chia-kan 嚴家淦 (Yan Jiagan, died 1993),[144] and most recently the first Taiwan-born president, Lee Teng-hui (Li Denghui 李登輝, died 2020), the successor of Chiang's son Chiang Ching-kuo in this function.

---

[140] On the Chiang Kai-shek memorial hall, cf. Marc Andre Matten: "The Chiang Kai-shek Memorial Hall in Taipei: A Contested Place of Memory". In: Marc Andre Matten (ed.): *Places of Memory in Modern China: History, Politics, and Identity*, Leiden: Brill 2011, pp.51-89. For a perceptive view on the shifting of the hall's meaning and on built heritage of KMT rule on Taiwan more generally after the KMT victory in the 2008 elections, see Jeremy E. Taylor: „Discovering a Nationalist heritage in present-day Taiwan". In: *China Heritage Quarterly* no. 17, March 2009. Available online: http://www.chinaheritagequarterly.org/articles.php?searchterm=017_taiwan.inc&issue=017.

[141] John Chiang, extramarital son of Chiang Ching-kuo (see below), for one, tried to prevent the shift away from Taoyuan county. Cf. Flora Wang: "Chiang seeks help on mausoleums". In: *Taipei Times*, Dec. 10, 2007, p. 1. Available online: http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/front/archives/2007/12/10/2003391902. Chiang Kai-shek's sarcophagus has been attacked recently in 2018 by activists at the memorial day of the traumatic February 28 incident of 1947, the major bloody crack-down and start of White Terror in Taiwan by Chiang Kai-shek to mute opposition to his rule on the island. On the vandalism attack, see: "Tomb of Chiang Kai-shek vandalized on 228 Peace Memorial Day". In: *Focus Taiwan*, Feb. 28, 2018. Available online: https://focustaiwan.tw/politics/201802280010.

[142] The cemetery has its own website: https://afrc.mnd.gov.tw/Cemetery/. (Chinese original is recommended as the English versions offered are problematic.)

[143] The Wuchih Mountain Cemetery is not the only military cemetery on Taiwan, but the most prominent, hosting, i.a., General Ho Ying-chin (He Yingqin 何應欽, died 1987) who was a long-term military and political key figure of the KMT and the one to formally accept the Japanese surrender at the end of the Second Sino-Japanese War in Nanking in 1945.

[144] Since Chiang Kai-shek died during a 6-year term, Yen as his deputy took over, and only then Chiang Ching-kuo became president.

Chiang Wei-kuo himself was the biological son of Chiang Kai-shek's close friend and noted KMT intellectual Dai Jitao 戴季陶 and a Japanese nurse, Shigematsu Kaneko 重松金子. Since Wei-kuo was born out of wedlock, Dai Jitao suggested to Chiang Kai-shek to adopt him, and the latter had him raised by his concubine Yao Yecheng 姚冶誠 (see below), whom Wei-kuo treated as his "mother", while calling Dai Jitao "uncle" and Chiang Kai-shek "father". Later, Wei-kuo was sent to Nazi Germany for study and military education. Thereafter he completed his military training in the U.S. His late oral autobiographical accounts of the early 1990s, arranged by his Taiwanese interviewer, were notably published not only as late as a decade after Wei-kuo's death, but furthermore in the PRC, not Taiwan, as Wei-kuo (and his interviewer who however died as well before the publication) were at odds with the "Taiwanisation" going on in Taiwan since the 1990s.[145] In fact, Wei-kuo himself played with the idea to be rather buried on the mainland. However, he knew this would not be his choice in the end, since already his suggestion late in his life to move the remains of Chiang Kai-shek and Chiang Ching-kuo to the mainland had been vetoed by his "stepmother" Soong May-ling, who outlived him.[146] In any case, although the Wuchih Mountain Cemetery was there as an option, beyond Wei-kuo no other Chiang is interred there yet.

Chiang Wei-kuo's elder "brother", Chiang Kai-shek's only biological son born to his first wife Mao Fumei 毛福梅, Chiang Ching-kuo,[147] who would later succeed his father as a president on Taiwan, had not been interred in the Wuchih Mountain Cemetery at his death in 1988.[148] Instead, he is "awaiting" with his father (in "respectful distance" and similar layout of the temporary mausoleum, Western-style black sarcophagus and cross of chrysanthemums – in Taiwan no controversial issue – included) the "return" to the mainland in Daxi 大溪 in Taoyuan county as well. This way, also with the burial issue, the theoretical claim to the mainland was upheld, avoiding to be "localised" in Taiwan's soil, instead. Different from his father, though, Ching-kuo was at least joined by the ashes of his Soviet wife Faina when the latter died in 2004 and was – unlike both her husband and her father-in-law – cremated as is widespread practice in Taiwan since the Japanese colonial period. Faina had reportedly tried to have Ching-kuo and his father interred in the Wuchih Mountain Military Cemetery, which however did not materialise due to opposition of other family members.[149] In a way, this also affected her and

[145] The mainland publishers, in turn, stated that they "corrected" some of the original pejorative wording regarding the CCP before releasing the publication to the mainland readership, but also wanted to counter with the publication the current Taiwanese tendencies to criticise the Chiang rule and call for "de-sinicisation": Jiang Weiguo koushu 蒋纬国口述, Liu Fenghan zhengli 刘凤翰整理 (Told by Chiang Wei-kuo, arranged by Liu Fenghan): *Jiang Weiguo koushu zizhuan* 蒋纬国口述自传 (Chiang Wei-kuo tells his life), Beijing: Zhongguo dabaike quanshu chubanshe 2008.

[146] See Jason Blatt and Felix Chan: "Chiang's son to be 'buried in Taiwan'". In: *South China Morning Post*, Sept. 25, 1997, p. 12. For May-ling's veto, see also her biography by journalist Laura Tyson Li: *Madame Chiang Kai-shek: China's Eternal First Lady*, New York: Atlantic Monthly Press 2006, p. 452.

[147] According to Taylor's informants, Chiang Kai-shek's mother asked him to officially register and inscribe his son Chiang Ching-kuo on the ancestral tablets as son of Chiang Kai-shek's deceased brother who had died at age four to provide him with nominal offspring. See Taylor: *The Generalissimo's Son* 2000, p. 7.

[148] It might be mentioned that the relationship between Wei-kuo and Ching-kuo was not the best. See, e.g., Wei-kuo's autobiographical accounts which feature repeated critical remarks on the by then deceased Ching-kuo: Jiang Weiguo/Liu Fenghan: *Jiang Weiguo koushu zizhuan*, passim.

[149] Cf. Teng Sue-feng 滕淑芬 [Teng Shufen]: "Xingxiao 'liang Jiang' hua liang Jiang 行銷「兩蔣」話兩蔣 / Remembering Chiang, selling Chiang". In: *Taiwan guanghua zazhi* 台灣光華雜誌 / *Taiwan Panorama* 2008/8,

her own burial choices, not the least because her three sons had predeceased her, while her daughter lived in far-away North America.

Chiang Ching-kuo and Faina had met in the Soviet Union. In 1925, 15-year old Ching-kuo had been sent there by his father – at the time not yet a "rightist" – for study, and he would stay on for considerable time. After arrival in the Soviet Union, he had soon become politically active, entered the Communist Youth League (Komsomol), and felt attracted by the Trotsky faction subsequently, until Stalin's rise ruled this out. His early relationship with his co-student, the daughter of Chinese "Christian" warlord Feng Yuxiang 馮玉祥,[150] having failed, not the least for political reasons, he was sent to the workforce and built up a family in the mid-1930s with his Belarusian co-worker Faina Vakhreva there. Moving back to China in spring 1937 in the context of a temporary easing of relations between Chiang Kai-shek and Stalin, Ching-kuo's Soviet wife had to arrange with her by now fervently anti-Communist father-in-law. Background to Ching-kuo's return to China was the Xi'an incident of December 1936, which had forced Chiang Kai-shek into agreeing to a second United Front with the Communists to ward off the Japanese. The Soviet Union with its own interests opposed to the Japanese thus was a plausible partner for China at this stage. Chiang Ching-kuo, who had (willingly or not) officially denounced his father in the Soviet Union earlier because of the latter's anti-Communist moves in China since 1927, thus was sent back by Stalin to China at this point. His father, on his part, ordered him to "rethink" and write an account of his time in the Soviet Union. This account would be also translated into English many years later and published by his CIA-friend Ray Cline,[151] since Chiang Ching-kuo had over time become responsible for the Secret Service on his father's orders. (This meant, that he was also responsible for the often bloody suppression of political dissidents, including the White Terror on Taiwan later.)[152] In fact, though, Ching-kuo did not only write this account for his father, denouncing the Soviet Union as expected, but another one, too, which contained many positive recollections of daily life there, likely written in Russian which was the language he was most familiar with at the time, but subsequently published in Chinese.[153] In how far Faina, the former Soviet woman worker, was aware (or informed) of the political ongoing beyond her family, is not clear. In

available online in Chinese and English versions: https://www.taiwan-panorama.com/Articles/Details?Guid=4b079827-cc59-4000-a7e3-74d9bc83b334&CatId=1.

[150] Feng Yuxiang had become a Methodist and thus was called the "Christian warlord". The unregistered "marriage" of Chiang Ching-kuo with Feng Yuxiang's daughter in the Moscow student days of the mid-1920s was politically problematic, and she returned to China with her siblings in 1928. See Taylor: *The Generalissimo's Son* 2000, pp. 37-38, p. 46, and p. 51. See also Elizabeth McGuire: *Red at Heart: How Chinese Communists Fell in Love with the Russian Revolution*, Oxford: Oxford University Press 2018, pp. 124-129. One may add, that Feng Yuxiang's second wife Li Dequan 李德全 (i.e. the stepmother of the Feng siblings in Moscow) acted as witness to Chiang Kai-shek's and Soong May-ling's marriage in late 1927 after Chiang's purge of the Communists. Later, though, the Fengs would become estranged from Chiang, and while Feng Yuxiang died under dubious circumstances in 1948 in a fire on a ship on the Black Sea, Li Dequan stayed on in mainland China and became Minister of Health in the PRC.

[151] It was published as an appendix in Cline's book: Ray S. Cline: *Chiang Ching-kuo Remembered: The Man and his Political Legacy*, Washington, D.C.: United States Global Strategy Council 1989, and clearly anti-Communist.

[152] Notably, during his lifetime a critical biographer of his, Henry Liu, was assassinated in the U.S. by killers probably trained by the KMT Secret Service, causing a scandal also abroad and damaging Ching-kuo's image in spite of his decisive contribution to enable Taiwan's democratisation after his death. The murder and legal procedures were an international Public Relations disaster for Taiwan.

[153] McGuire contrasts both accounts for events described in both: see her *Red at Heart* 2018, chapters 7 and 9.

any case, she also had to move to Taiwan in 1949 with her father-in-law, her husband and the by-now four children, never seeing her native soil again. She could, however, write private letters "home",[154] and at least join her husband in death.

This was different in the case of her father-in-law, Chiang Kai-shek, who remained single in death. That the earlier wives or concubines of Chiang Kai-shek were not allowed to be officially mentioned in any form in the context of his death, including Chiang's first wife and Ching-kuo's mother, Mao Fumei, whom he had divorced,[155] is needless to say, as even Chiang Kai-shek's last wife Soong May-ling (see below for the Soongs), married to Chiang since 1927, did not join him at her death in 2003. Chiang Kai-shek's other wives/concubines all had died before him in any case.

Mao Fumei, for one, whom Chiang Kai-shek divorced only after the death of his mother in 1921, since she had been the one to arrange their marriage in traditional fashion, had been tragically killed during the Second Sino-Japanese War in 1939. Her death was caused by a Japanese air raid on Chiang Kai-shek's home where she had been left behind while the Chiang government was already in far-away Chungking, and her son Ching-kuo serving in Jiangxi Province. After a temporary storage of her remains, her son Chiang Ching-kuo who had a first stone slab inscribed on the occasion: *yi xue xi xue* 以血洗血 ("It takes blood to wash out blood") – which was predictably destroyed by the Japanese when they took the area –[156] and who had called his mother "Mao *furen* 夫人" as if she were not divorced but still married, [157] saw to it that she was properly reburied after the war. The tombstone tactfully evaded to name her former husband. By this, also Chiang Kai-shek's then-wife Soong May-ling would not feel offended. Wu Zhihui 吳稚暉, a close friend of the Chiangs and a KMT elder, wrote the final tombstone inscription in a way to honour Mao Fumei in Ching-kuo's view ("My late mother, Grand Madame Mao" *xian bi Mao taijun* 顯妣毛太君), but to not disclose whose wife she had been, neither that she had been divorced – and thus avoiding the critical term *furen* this time.[158]

---

[154] Cf. McGuire: *Red at Heart* 2018, p. 167: The letters were "read and kept in Soviet archives".

[155] It might be mentioned that Chiang Kai-shek, though, did not completely sever all ties to Mao Fumei's family as her brother would remain in Chiang's entourage also later. Cf. Taylor: *The Generalissimo* 2009, pp. 463-464.

[156] At the place, the presently exhibited slab (at least at my visit of 2011) is said to have been re-done by Chiang Ching-kuo after the war "identical to the original" which had been destroyed by the Japanese during the war. See also the popular booklet: Wang Tiancang: *Xikou fengguang* 2003, pp. 41-43; and Yang Guoqing: *Minguo mingren mu* 1998, pp. 184-186.

[157] A reproduction of the original stone slab at the place of her coffin's temporary storage awaiting proper burial, where one may notice that Ching-kuo chose to call his mother "Mao *furen*", as well as a photo of Ching-kuo's family at the later tomb of Mao Fumei, can be found in: Xu Haoran 徐浩然, Zhang Xiuwei 章修维, Luo Linlu 罗林禄: *Jiang Jingguo de shengsi lianren: Zhang Yaruo* 蒋经国的生死恋人. 章亚若 (Jiang Jingguo's life-and-death lover: Zhang Yaruo), Beijing: Tuanjie chubanshe 2007, pp. 148-149. (The authors of this popular history book include a former friend of Zhang Yaruo, i.e. the mother of the extramarital twin sons of Chiang Ching-kuo – see below, a relative of hers, as well as a professional writer. The PRC authors were backed by John Chang, one of the twins.)

[158] Cf. Taylor: *The Generalissimo's Son* 2000, p. 146. See the photo of Mao Fumei's tomb in Xu / Zhang / Luo: *Jiang Jingguo de shengsi lianren*, p. 149, with the full inscription in the Chinese original and the various issues at stake briefly discussed on p. 150 (though without mentioning KMT-elder Wu Zhihui by name as the one to find the "naming solution"). See also the popular account in Wang Tiancang: *Xikou fengguang*, p. 43, noting that Dai Jitao had written a first version using the Chiang name and the *furen* designation, which was not deemed

(These "tombstone problems" resemble those of Sun Yat-sen's first wife Lu Muzhen who was called "mother of Sun Fo" to get around the issue of divorce.) Wu Zhihui also had a teacher-student relationship with Chiang Ching-kuo who had briefly frequented his school in Peking set up in 1925 (and forced to close in 1927) for the children of revolutionaries, especially for those with an international biography, which Ching-kuo attended prior to his move to the Soviet Union. Sun Fo's two sons, who had come from the South to Peking in 1925 because of their grandfather Sun Yat-sen's death, went there, too (reportedly at first struggling with standard Mandarin).[159] Warlord Feng Yuxiang also sent at least one of his children there who would become close to Chiang Ching-kuo later in the Soviet Union, as mentioned.[160] Given these interpersonal connections, Wu Zhihui was an appropriate person to take on the delicate tombstone affair for a "final definition" of Mao Fumei.[161]

The other women connected to Chiang Kai-shek, however, lived longer and faced the critical year of 1949. Yao Yecheng, Chiang's concubine, moved to Taiwan with Chiang Wei-kuo, Chiang Kai-shek's adopted son, whom she had raised. She thus was buried in Taiwan at her demise in 1966. Chen Jieru 陳潔如 ("Jennie"), in turn, who claimed to have been Chiang's wife in the 1920s while he later claimed her to have been only his concubine,[162] had adopted a girl while living with Chiang and had been sent abroad when Chiang prepared to marry Soong May-ling. After her return to China, Chiang ignored her. In 1949, she stayed on in the PRC – Taiwan clearly being no option in her case –, having forged ties with by-now premier Zhou Enlai 周恩来 back in the days of the Whampoa Military Academy in the mid-1920s. At the time, Zhou had been responsible for political instruction, while Chiang was the military head there. Zhou, who had been one of the key Communists in "united front work", arranged for her to move out to Hong Kong in 1961, presumably to work for a "united front" there. At Chen

acceptable. Wu Zhihui's more explicit full biographical eulogy of Ching-kuo's mother is reprinted in the appendix of the popular book of Zhao Hong 赵宏: *Jiang Jieshi jiazu de nürenmen* 蒋介石家族的女人们 (The women of the Chiang Kai-shek clan), Beijing: Tuanjie chubanshe 2007, pp. 291-292. (This publishing house, by the way, directed at furthering "cross-Strait relations", produced a whole series of biographical popular books around 2007/2008 on the Chiangs and Soong May-ling, possibly in the context of the upcoming elections in Taiwan in 2008 which would result in a power shift from the DPP back to the KMT.)

[159] See Shen Feide (*Minguo diyi jia* 2002), p. 225.

[160] Taylor: *The Generalissimo's Son* 2000, p. 22.

[161] According to Chinese custom, at the closing of the coffin the "final evaluation" of a person is fixed (gai guan lun ding 蓋棺論定) – at least in theory.

[162] The noted mainland historian Yang Tianshi who has studied Chen Jieru's memoirs in some detail and confronted them with the more recently accessible diaries of Chiang Kai-shek and further materials, concludes that Chen Jieru's claim to formal marriage is not substantiated. Cf. Yang Tianshi 楊天石: *Zhaoxun zhenshi de Jiang Jieshi. Jiang Jieshi riji jiedu (er)* 找尋真實的蔣介石. 蔣介石日記解讀 (二) (Looking for the true Chiang Kai-shek. Interpreting Chiang Kai-shek's diaries (2)), Hong Kong edition: Sanlian shudian 2010, pp. 507-510. A different evaluation had been provided by Lloyd Eastman who edited and translated her memoirs in 1993 (Lloyd E. Eastman (ed. and intr.): *Chiang Kai-shek's Secret Past: The Memoir of his Second Wife, Ch'en Chieh-ju*, Boulder, San Francisco, Oxford: Westview Press 1993, p. xiv and pp. 35-42), with reference to a sealed marriage certificate archived (reproduced in translation on p. 38). According to Yang Tianshi, the materials Chen Jieru provided were often forgeries. (See also Yang Tianshi: *Zhaoxun zhenshi de Jiang Jieshi. Jiang Jieshi riji jiedu (yi)* 找尋真實的蔣介石. 蔣介石日記解讀 (一) (Looking for the true Chiang Kai-shek. Interpreting Chiang Kai-shek's diaries (1)), Chongqing edition: Chongqing chubanshe 2015, pp. 452, 542-543. [The Chongqing edition has some changes in the arrangement and selection of Yang Tianshi's scholarship on the subject – in part former articles – and provides additional photo material not available in the original Hong Kong/mainland editions of 2008 of this volume. One chapter on Chen Jieru's memoirs was, in fact, published subsequently to the original edition and thus is integrated in the Chongqing edition only.])

Jieru's death in Hong Kong in 1971 (i.e. during the neighbouring PRC's Cultural Revolution times), her "daughter" and her sister-in-law got a special permission to travel from Shanghai to Hong Kong for the funeral. However, after Hong Kong's handover to the PRC, her remains were moved from there to Shanghai's top-cemetery,[163] Fushouyuan 福壽園.[164] Although one may argue that in her case, like with Sun Yat-sen's first wife Lu Muzhen, the respective "handover" opened up the possibility of "returning" to their native soil, i.e. the ideal place for burial in Chinese view, captured in the usual phrase of *luo ye gui gen* 落葉歸根 (the fallen leaf returns to the root), such moves had also a clearly political side to it.

With Chiang Kai-shek's son Chiang Ching-kuo, in turn, burial affairs became complicated as well, if in his case rather in the longer run. Ching-kuo had joined the Methodist Church in 1943 on the insistence of his father and stepmother Soong May-ling,[165] but in other regards he differed from his father. Most notably, he posed more as a "family man" and preferred a much simpler funeral arrangement,[166] given his wish to be buried near his hapless mother Mao Fumei on the mainland someday in the future. Over time, however, it became known that beyond the four children with Faina, he had fathered two further twin sons out of wedlock. These were born in mainland China in 1942 during the war, while the mother of these sons, Zhang Yaruo 章亞若, died unexpectedly, only months after their birth, said to have been poisoned to get her out of the way.[167] The extramarital twins, raised by their maternal uncle and aunt, were, however, transferred to Taiwan in 1949, secretly funded by their biological father Chiang Ching-kuo who obviously cared but never openly acknowledged them, and they made their careers in Taiwan. Only in 2002 when one of them had already died, the remaining twin John Chang, a KMT lawyer himself, could publicly prove his claims.[168] Of the four legal children of Ching-kuo, at this point all three sons (and thus "successors of the line") were dead.[169]

---

[163] See the short entry on her on the cemetery website: http://www.shfsy.com/cyclopedia/chenjieru/. She apparently had asked for this in lifetime (see her translated memoirs: Eastman: *Chiang Kai-shek's Secret Past* 1993, insertion after p. 138: "Who has the Love Letters Chiang Wrote to Her?").

[164] Cf. Müller: *Between History, Heritage, and Foreign Relations* 2018, p. 32. Incidentally, the Fushouyuan-group is Hong Kong-based, setting up "high-class" cemeteries in different places.

[165] See: "Chiang's death ends an epic dynasty". In: *South China Morning Post*, January 14, 1988, p. 7.

[166] See: Taylor: *The Generalissimo's Son* 2000, pp. 422-425.

[167] John Chang (now: Chiang) later rejected the assumption that Chiang Kai-shek or Chiang Ching-kuo were behind her death. A former aide of Chiang Ching-kuo was insinuated as a suspect, whose family, though, strongly objected to this shift of responsibilities. See the PRC website: "Jiang Xiaoyan tan muqin Zhang Yaruo liqi siwang zhenxiang" 蒋孝严谈母亲章亚若离奇死亡真相 (John Chiang tells the truth about his mother Zhang Yaruo's mysterious death). In: *Wangyi lishi* 网易历史 / *Netease* August 7, 2009, available online: http://history.news.163.com/09/0806/14/5G1R57H500011247_all.html. The original article appeared in the journal *Bainianchao* 百年潮 ("Hundred Year Tide"). Apparently, John Chang/Chiang used mainland publications as an alternative outlet to the Taiwanese ones.

[168] See "John Chang gets new identity". In: *Taipei Times*, December 14, 2002. Available online: http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2002/12/14/0000187128. In 2005, finally, he switched his surname from his mother's (Chang) to his biological father's (Chiang). See "Chang has become Chiang". In: *Taipei Times*, March 8, 2005. Available online: http://www.taipeitimes.com/News/taiwan/archives/2005/03/08/2003245367. (The above-mentioned popular history book on his biological mother Zhang Yaruo, published in the PRC, was obviously connected to this effort.)

[169] The fact, that many of the third generation of the Chiang-Soong-Kung families died early, was interpreted as a "curse" in popular minds in Taiwan. It might be mentioned that Ching-kuo's second son, Alex, was untypically buried not in Christian but Buddhist fashion: his second wife was, in fact, the first Taiwan-born member of the Chiang clan.

Subsequently, after Soong May-ling (who refused to meet John Chang) and Faina (who, it is claimed, was shielded from the information about the extramarital twins' existence) had died in 2003 and 2004 respectively, the surviving twin John Chang changed his surname to Chiang to openly insist on being acknowledged into the Chiang family. He thus became the only living male representative of this generation on Ching-kuo's side.[170] The not-yet finalised tombstones of Chiang Kai-shek and Chiang Ching-kuo, due to the named diverging opinions in the larger Chiang family whether they should be provisionally buried in the Wuchih Mountain Military Cemetery or even sent to the mainland already, also helped evade the problem of naming the "bereaved" explicitly anyway. The layout for the tombs of the "two Chiangs", in any case, had been already quickly set up by the DPP government (after Faina's demise) in 2005 to receive them in the Wuchih Mountain Military Cemetery, with or without a second "state funeral",[171] should the decision ever be taken.[172]

The Soongs

The Soongs, finally, are the most varied case, as they split up, largely due to politics. May-ling moved away from Taiwan to New York after her husband Chiang Kai-shek's death, with only some briefer and one longer stay in Taiwan thereafter. She returned for a longer stay in the second half of the 1980s when Chiang Ching-kuo's health deteriorated, witnessing the shift to Lee Teng-hui, a Taiwanese of Hakka descent, whom she did not manage to prevent from succeeding as Taiwan's president. He would introduce full democracy, thus effectively ending the Chiang rule also in structure. Soong May-ling, whose voice was overruled by her own Party, the KMT, thus decided to move her permanent residence back to the U.S. for good.

Reportedly, May-ling was quite concerned about her own place of burial,[173] ideally – when feasible at some point in the future – with Chiang Kai-shek in Nanking or at his native place in Zhejiang. But since he probably would be buried then without her for political reasons, i.e. similar to Sun Yat-sen, she would rather do as her sister Ching-ling: join her parents in Shanghai instead. As this was not acceptable even for the KMT at the time being, the U.S. was the remaining option, because she refused to be buried in Taiwan. (Whether this meant that she did never care for Taiwan as such, or rather feared the DPP-driven reckoning with the

[170] Chiang Wei-kuo also fathered one son: Chiang Hsiao-kang (Jiang Xiaogang 蔣孝剛).

[171] Cf. Jeremy Taylor: "QuJianghua: Disposing of and Re-appraising the Remnants of Chiang Kai-shek's Reign in Taiwan". In: *Journal of Contemporary History* vol. 45(1), 2010, pp. 181-196, there p. 185, referring to a group set up by relatives of the 1947 "February 28 incident" victims in 2004 to oppose any possible second state funeral.

[172] Cf. "Liang Jiang heshi yiling. Jiang jia wu ren ke zuo zhu" 兩蔣何時移靈 蔣家無人可做主 (When will the two dead Chiangs be moved over? In the Chiang family there is no one to decide). In: *Ziyou shibao* 自由時報 ("The Liberty Times") April 24, 2016. Available online: https://news.ltn.com.tw/news/politics/paper/982471. In addition, the area was found to be very badly drained in 2018, leading to coffins of people buried close-by being full of water, which did not recommend this solution to the Chiang family. Cf. a pertinent TV reportage available online: https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QJl4kqwDBhE&feature=youtu.be. (I am grateful to my doctoral student Chang Yu-shan for this reference.)

[173] According to Laura Tyson Li's informants: cf. Li: *Madame Chiang Kai-shek* 2006, p. 457.

authoritarian rule of her husband with possible consequences for tombs, is open to speculation.)[174] In any case, having no offspring herself, she decided for joining her siblings in New York who had predeceased her. She was particularly close to her sister Ai-ling and her family. But also brothers T.V. and T.L. had lived their final years in New York, while the youngest brother T.A. had lived in San Francisco. Although H.H. Kung was the first of the larger family to die in 1967 in New York, followed by a large burial attended even by future U.S. president Nixon (who would, though, initiate the U.S. foreign policy "turn" to the PRC when in office),[175] of the Soong siblings it was the youngest, T.A., who was the first to be buried. He had suffered a stroke and died in 1969 on a business trip to Hong Kong, to be then transferred back to California for burial.[176]

The siblings' burials could not escape political contestations, which complicated the family affair it otherwise would have been. In the case of T.A. in 1969, but for Ching-ling, all other siblings attended, May-ling coming over from Taiwan as she had done two years earlier for H.H. Kung. However, when T.V. died unexpectedly by choking to death in 1971, a time when the rivalry between the governments of the PRC and Taiwan was coming to the internationally critical point where the Nixon-led U.S. warmed ties with Peking at the expense of Taipei, and the PRC was about to finally overturn Taiwan as representative of "China" in the UN,[177] things were different. Chiang Kai-shek was still alive, and May-ling who wanted to fly from Taiwan to New York was stopped en route in Hawai'i on his orders because of fear that the Communists would send Ching-ling to exploit the family affair politically.[178] Ching-ling was, however, blocked to attend as well.[179] In Ching-ling's case, the official reason given was that at brief notice "no plane could be hired" as no direct flights existed at the time between the PRC and the U.S., necessitating to arrange for a flight over a third country.[180] The third sister, Ai-ling, in turn, feared to get involved and thus also opted out.[181] Thus, of all the siblings, only T.L. was there at T.V.'s burial. A similar dilemma occurred with Ai-ling's funeral two years later, in 1973, again in New York.[182] The contrary then held when Ching-ling was next in 1981 (see

[174] In Taiwan, at her death, reactions varied widely. Cf. Jeremy E. Taylor: "Recycling Personality Cults: Observations of the Reactions to Madame Chiang Kai-Shek's Death in Taiwan". In: *Totalitarian Movements and Political Religions* vol. 7, no. 3, 2006, pp. 347-362.

[175] For the Kung burial, see: "300 Attend Service Here for H.H. Kung." In: *The New York Times*, August 23, 1967, p. 51. Soong May-ling came over from Taiwan, accompanied by Chiang Wei-kuo.

[176] See: "Many pay last respects to Mr. Soong Tse-an: Brother arrives from U.S.". In: *South China Morning Post*, March 7, 1969, p. 8. The "brother arriving" was T.V., and T.A. was then transferred back to the U.S. for burial. See "Body of Mme. Chiang's Brother Flown to U. S.". In: *Chicago Tribune*, March 9, 1969, p. A10.

[177] In April, when T.V. died, the PRC invited the U.S. table tennis team to Peking, starting the ping-pong diplomacy. Later that year, the PRC would achieve its long-cherished goal to take over the UN-seat from Taiwan, something politically well experienced T.V. had clearly realised to be in stock.

[178] Cf. Laura Tyson Li: *Madame Chiang Kai-shek* 2006, p. 405.

[179] See: "Sisters absent at Soong's funeral". In: *South China Morning Post*, May 3, 1971, p. 4.

[180] Cf. He Dazhang 何大章: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling: Xubian* 一個真實的宋慶齡. 續編 (The true Soong Ching-ling. Sequel), Hong Kong: Xianggang zhonghe chuban 2020, pp. 389-390.

[181] It might be also mentioned that H.H. Kung, who had often rivalled T.V. in his financial-political career, had also been buried in 1967 without T.V.'s participation. (See Yang Guoqing: *Minguo mingren mu* 1998, p. 292.) Some general information on T.V.'s burial is provided in Wu and Kuo (eds.): *Song Ziwen* (2013), pp. 157-164, with the apparent agenda to counter the impression that May-ling and T.V. had developed some conflicts: the reproduced English letter from May-ling to T.V.'s widow (p. 163) is, however, astonishingly unsentimental.

[182] When Ai-ling died after prolonged illness, neither May-ling nor Ching-ling could attend (Pakula: *The Last Empress* 2009, p. 650). May-ling, though, had come over for a visit shortly before her death.

below), though Chiang Kai-shek was dead by then and replaced by Chiang Ching-kuo. T.L. (in 1987) and May-ling (in 2003) were the last to die, both ending their lives in New York.

The "New York" siblings, at least, shared the same cemetery, the prestigious Ferncliff Cemetery in Hartsdale, New York, with Ai-ling[183] joining her husband H.H. Kung, and May-ling in adjacent private family rooms – the most costly variant. The four children of Ai-ling and H.H. Kung were also buried there, the only daughter surviving aunt May-ling whom she had cared for in old age, joining her at her own death in 2008.[184] Of the Kung's four children, the two most controversial ones (David and Jeanette)[185] remained single, Rosamonde was childless and is buried there together with her last husband and aunt May-ling, while oil magnate Louis, the youngest, was divorced at his death. (He was the only one to have a son by his marriage with a non-Chinese – an additional particularity –, the Hollywood actress Debra Paget.) The Kung children thus stayed with their parents – and aunt May-ling – in death in the two adjacent private rooms. T.V. Soong, for his part, remains some corners away, together with his wife (died 1988),[186] and not in a private room. T.L. died in New York (in 1987) as well, and is buried together with his wife and only daughter,[187] while T.A., as mentioned, is buried in California with his wife (died 2012). In sum, five of the six Soong siblings are buried in the U.S., together with their families. Interestingly, none chose to add a Christian marker on their tombstones although especially Ai-ling and May-ling were known to be active religious practitioners, and while T.V., T.L., T.A. and May-ling added Chinese characters for their names, Ai-ling and the whole Kung family did not. This is an additional indirect sign that the tombs were considered temporary, since the Kungs were known to be proud of claiming descent from Confucius. It should be also noted, that all these resting places are above ground, i.e. in Chinese understanding not yet final, which would require soil.

Only Ching-ling, who opted for the Communists and thus stayed on in mainland China, is buried there, and she is the only one cremated according to standard on the mainland at the time, while Chinese tradition favoured earth burial.[188] The responsible cadre for her Peking

[183] On her tombstone, the family used the alternative spelling "E-ling".

[184] She was apparently the only one of the Kung children to revisit the mainland after aunt May-ling's death, documented by a photograph of 2008, shortly before her death, showing her in a wheelchair at her grandparents' tomb, i.e. of the Soong parents. See "Song Qingling lingyuan de fangke" 宋庆龄陵园的访客 (The visitors of the Song Qingling Memorial Park) (2018) with photographs. Available online: https://www.thepaper.cn/news Detail_forward_2568577.

[185] David had been involved in various questionable business deals and money transfers and even once taken in custody by Chiang Ching-kuo during the latter's anti-corruption campaign in Shanghai 1948, until aunt May-ling intervened on his behalf. Jeanette became known for being queer and repeatedly provocative in social contexts.

[186] As of 2019 when I visited, the eldest daughter has prepared to join them, like her husband has done already, by having her name carved in. She, too, revisited the mainland in 2008, as a photograph at the Shanghai tomb of her grandparents, i.e. the Soong parents, documents. See, again: "Song Qingling lingyuan de fangke" (2018), available online.

[187] T.L. is also not in a private room: see for a photo of the tomb: https://zhuanlan.zhihu.com/p/98370719. Jung Chang (*Big Sister, Little Sister, Red Sister* 2019, p. 302) mentions that T.L. had problems with arriving at a secure financial basis in the U.S. and thus stayed somewhat apart from his better-off siblings. Cf. also Epstein: *Woman in World History* 1993, p. 609, citing Soong Ching-ling's letter to Richard Young in the U.S. referring to such news given to her.

[188] Buddhism, though, had introduced cremation to China already earlier, but earth burial remained the dominant variant.

Residence and researcher of her life, He Dazhang 何大章, takes pains to stress that she was not forced to agree to the by-then usual cremation but that her staff reported she had chosen it herself.[189] In fact, though several leading Communists had signed a pledge in the 1950s to have themselves cremated, and cremation became state policy thereafter,[190] some prominent former leftist KMT figures who had arranged themselves with the Communists but could help build cross-Strait bridges in the future, were exempted from the rule. Most notable and close to Soong Ching-ling among them was He Xiangning 何香凝, the wife of the (1925) assassinated potential Sun Yat-sen successor, Liao Zhongkai 廖仲愷.

He Xiangning, a noted painter of the Lingnan 嶺南 school and activist for women's rights, born in Hong Kong, had been friends with the younger Ching-ling since many decades and was like her a figurehead of the "Revolutionary" KMT, i.e. the block party version in the PRC. She and her husband Liao Zhongkai, an American-born Cantonese of Hakka descent, had been close to Sun Yat-sen since 1903 in Japan. Their daughter Liao Mengxing 廖梦醒, born 1904, had helped translate for Soong Ching-ling in Japan during the controversial marriage ceremony with Sun Yat-sen in Japan in 1915, Japanese to English, and He Xiangning had been the only female testimony of Sun's official last will in 1925. She also accompanied Soong Ching-ling when the exact burial site for Sun in Nanking had to be chosen after his death in 1925. Soong Ching-ling remained close to this internationally experienced multi-lingual "Cantonese" family ever since, daughter Liao Mengxing serving later as her secretary (having become a Communist herself). Liao Mengxing's younger brother Liao Chengzhi 廖承志, born during the family's time in Japan, would join the Communists even before his sister. Over the years, he would be imprisoned several times, once in Shanghai by the KMT, and once during inner-Communist power struggles by his own "comrades", and then did underground work in Hong Kong for some time, until he was imprisoned again by Chiang Ching-kuo during the Second Sino-Japanese War. His life was only spared due to strong campaigning, including Soong Ching-ling's intervention on his behalf, and Chiang Kai-shek's consideration of He Xiangning's standing in the KMT as Liao Zhongkai's widow. In PRC times, Liao Chengzhi would become a key figure in Sino-Japanese relations,[191] and cared for China's relations with Overseas Chinese, too. Late in his life and after Ching-ling's death, he would launch a public appeal to "younger brother" Chiang Ching-kuo whom he had known as a "Communist comrade" in the Soviet Union and later as his KMT captivator, then President on Taiwan, for closer cross-Strait ties (including the notable proposition to move Chiang Kai-shek's remains to the mainland, and adding "greetings" to Ching-kuo's Soviet wife Faina and the widowed Soong May-ling).[192] Given the "no contacts" policy of Taiwan at the time, Chiang Ching-kuo did not react. Instead, Soong May-ling in the U.S. took it unto herself to express sarcastically her

[189] He Dazhang 何大章: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling* 一個真實的宋慶齡 (The true Soong Ching-ling), Hong Kong: Xianggang zhonghe chuban, 3rd ed. 2016, p. 373.

[190] Cf. the catalogue of the specialised museum on funeral affairs in China: *Shanghai Binzang Bowuguan* 上海殡葬博物馆 ("Shanghai Funeral Museum"), n.p. [Shanghai], n.d. [2009 or after]. Mao himself had also signed, though he was not to be cremated but embalmed in the end.

[191] Cf. Kurt Werner Radtke: *China's Relations with Japan, 1945-83: The Role of Liao Chengzhi*, Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press 1990; and Mayumi Itoh: *Pioneers of Sino-Japanese Relations: Liao and Takasaki*, Basingstoke: Palgrave-MacMillan 2012.

[192] Liao Chengzhi's public letter was published in *Renmin ribao*, July 25, 1982, p. 1.

"sympathy" with "nephew" Liao Chengzhi's suffering during the recent Cultural Revolution which had meant so many people's death, not inviting anyone to look forward to closer ties, reminding him that he, in turn, owed his life to Chiang Kai-shek's "magnanimity" earlier.[193] The Liao family, in sum, was another of those criss-crossing relationships on a personal level to various sides around the Sun-Chiang-Soong family members.

When mother He Xiangning died in 1972 in high age, but during the difficult Cultural Revolution years, she was, in any case, exempted from cremation,[194] and joined her husband in death in Nanking in the vicinity of Sun Yat-sen's mausoleum, where Liao Zhongkai had been re-buried by the KMT with a belated state burial back in 1935.[195] After He Xiangning's burial with Liao Zhongkai, the Nanking (KMT) tombstone thus could also be "redesigned" (and thus appropriated) by their son and high Communist cadre Liao Chengzhi.[196]

With Soong Ching-ling, in turn, an analogous treatment would have been possible: no cremation, and a burial in Nanking, too. However, in her case the build-up of her husband Sun Yat-sen's tomb in the monumental Nanking mausoleum made it difficult to simply join him,[197] as He Xiangning had with Liao Zhongkai,[198] and his iconised role was a further deterring factor to frame him in terms of "family", on top of the problem to define "family" in his case. Furthermore, he stood for a revolutionary stage gone-by, while Soong Ching-ling was supposed to stand for the new era as "Honorary President of the PRC", the highest title awarded to her in her last days. Another likely alternative for Soong Ching-ling would have been the Babaoshan 八宝山 Cemetery, since this was the cemetery used for the top cadres, being located

[193] Her letter is available online on the website of the foundation in honour of Chiang Kai-shek: http://www.ccfd.org.tw/ccef001/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=3370:2015-04-20-07-10-19&catid=455&Itemid=258.

[194] See Yang Guoqing: *Minguo mingren mu* 1998, pp. 106-107.

[195] For a photograph of Liao Zhongkai's tomb in Canton before the reburial in Nanking, see Li Mei 李湄: *Jiaguo mengying: Muqin Liao Mengxing he tade shidai* 家國夢縈. 母親了夢醒和她的時代 (Dreaming of home and country: Mother Liao Mengxing and her times), Xianggang: Xianggang zhonghe chuban 2015, p. 116, and for one of the Nanking tomb in the early PRC (1956), see ibid., p. 340. Musgrove (*China's Contested Capital* 2013, p. 161) assumes that Liao's reburial in Nanking was delayed until 1935 because of He Xiangning's leftist leanings unpalatable to Chiang Kai-shek.

[196] The tomb is today a national-level historical relic on the larger grounds of the Sun Yat-sen mausoleum. For a photograph of the common tombstone, see Yang Guoqing: *Minguo mingren mu* 1998, p. 108.

[197] This "physical" aspect is usually not addressed in explanations for the burial location choice, typically forwarding Ching-ling's "modesty" etc. as a reason. The visible part of Sun's tomb – referencing the Napoléon model in Paris – is situated in a vault for visitors to look down on, and (unlike Napoléon) with a sarcophagus lid embellished with a sculpture of his (while his body is in a burial chamber underground). (On a side note, Napoléon's wives were also not buried with him, though one may add that in a further model for Sun's vault, the tomb of general and president Grant in New York, Grant's wife would be buried with him according to his last will – which would not have been possible had he gone to a military cemetery where burials of women were not allowed at the time. He thus chose New York.)

[198] Liao Zhongkai's tomb was beneath an above-ground tumulus structure which could rather easily be opened from the back side to add He Xiangning's coffin. See Yang Guoqing: *Minguo mingren mu* 1998, p. 107. Photographs of the time of He Xiangning's burial (1972) can be found in her granddaughter's book: Li Mei: *Jiaguo mengying* 2015, p. 379.

in Peking, the city where she lived her last years.[199] In the end, a large funeral ceremony was held for her in Peking, after which she was cremated in the Babaoshan crematorium. But then her ashes were transferred to Shanghai for burial at her parents' side, as she had wished.[200] This, however, also meant that she could claim the family heritage, thus playing out her advantage of having been the only one of the siblings to remain on the mainland after 1949. Due to politics, none of her then-living siblings (May-ling and T.L.) attended her pompous PRC state funeral in 1981,[201] while she herself had also not been allowed to attend any funeral of her siblings in the U.S., as mentioned. One may recall that these had died during the years of the PRC's Cultural Revolution period (T.A. in 1969, T.V. in 1971, Ai-ling 1973). It would have been even less conceivable for her to attend the overseas funerals of her "problematic" brothers-in-law (H.H. Kung 1969 in the U.S. and Chiang Kai-shek 1975 in Taiwan). Her stepson Sun Fo, too, had died in Taiwan (1973) in the meantime,[202] while his sister Sun Wan followed in 1979 in Macau (see above), and thus all of her nominal step-children, i.e. the children of Sun Yat-sen and Lu Muzhen, had predeceased Soong Ching-ling. This left only some Shanghai relatives of her mother Ni's side, who had remained in mainland China and had survived the Cultural Revolution in spite of being targeted as "bourgeois" and "religious",[203] and some of Sun Yat-sen's overseas grandchildren who followed the PRC's invitation to attend, as "family" representatives at Soong Ching-ling's funeral.[204]

---

[199] On the Babaoshan Cemetery, see the 3 volumes publication: He Husheng 何虎生 (ed.): *Babaoshan jishi* 八宝山纪事 (Babaoshan chronicle), Beijing: Zhonggong dangshi chubanshe 1998. This official Babaoshan Chronicle tried to explain why Ching-ling was not buried there. See there vol. 2, chapter 35, dedicated to Ching-ling.

[200] Cf. also the official version of her memorial park in Shanghai: Zhang Jieming 张洁明: "Song Qingling weihe anzang Wanguo gongmu Songshi mudi" 宋庆龄为何安葬万国公墓宋氏墓地 (Why was Soong Ching-ling buried in the Song family tomb in the International Cemetery?). Available online: http://www.shsoongching-ling.com/sqlxslt/xslt_yj/list200.html.

[201] Epstein, who had been asked by Ching-ling to write her biography after her death, mentions in *Woman in World History* 1993, p. 619, that Ching-ling's brother T.L., the widow of T.A. (and the eldest daughter of T.V. whom Epstein skipped) sent telegrams. Only her sister May-ling did not react, given Chiang Ching-kuo's adamant opposition. She sent a trusted person years later in 1998 to offer flowers to Ching-ling. See the respective photograph in the already referred-to contribution: "Song Qingling lingyuan de fangke", available online: https://www.thepaper.cn/newsDetail_forward_2568577.

[202] It was thus Sun Fo's widow Chen Suk-ying who sent a wreath for Ching-ling's burial. See: "Taipei rejects funeral invitation". In: *South China Morning Post*, June 2, 1981, p. 7. This, obviously, was treated as the most important "contribution" from overseas since Chen Suk-ying called Ching-ling dutifully "mother". (They were, in fact, of the same age). (Cf. He Husheng: *Babaoshan jishi* vol. 2, p. 778.)

[203] For the tragic story of her Ni family cousin who had appealed to Ching-ling, then in Peking, for help during the Cultural Revolution and finally committed suicide just opposite Ching-ling's Shanghai home by throwing herself from a building once in possession of H.H. Kung, see He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling* 2016, pp. 207-212.

[204] Thus, at Ching-ling's funeral, there were only two direct relatives, i.e. from mother Ni's side, a cousin of Ching-ling and the daughter of another cousin. (See Luo Yuanxu 罗元旭 / York Lo: *Dongcheng xijiu: Qige huaren jidujiao jiazu yu Zhong-Xi jiaoliu bainian* 东成西就. 七个华人基督教家族与中西交流百年 / *East and West: Chinese Christian Families and Their Roles in Two Centuries of East-West Relations* (text in Chinese), Beijing: Shenghuo, Dushu, Xinzhi sanlian shuju 2014, p. 208, and the convenient ancestral tree of the Nis on pp. 212-217.) However, almost all of the Nis and the Suns were living abroad, as did the Soongs. Sun Fo's daughters, including the extramarital ones, came over from the U.S. for the burial, not, however, the sons as "bearers of the name". (For Lily Sun's attendance, see the photos on her website in honour of Sun Yat-sen: http://www.sinofather.org/index.php?s=/Home/Index/category/cid/36.html.) For a PRC overview on the invited relatives from abroad, see the official Babaoshan Chronicle (since Ching-ling was cremated at Babaoshan): He Husheng: *Babaoshan jishi* vol. 2, p. 778. The invited included also the Kung children who, unsurprisingly, did not react, given their particularly bad relationship with the Communists, just like Chiang Ching-kuo and Chiang Wei-kuo who were, in any case, "family" only in a very extended sense.

In fact, the Cultural Revolution years, conventionally dated 1966-1976, during which almost all of the mentioned "family funerals" occurred overseas, had been challenging for "bourgeois" Ching-ling herself. Sun Yat-sen's 100th birthday, celebrated in November 1966 (according to Western reckoning as used in the PRC, unlike Taiwan the year before) in Peking in the early phase of the Cultural Revolution, had provided Soong Ching-ling with the chance to hold a long speech on her former husband's revolutionary ideals and credentials. And Zhou Enlai made sure Mao's positive comments on Sun of 10 years earlier at his 90th anniversary would be recalled,[205] given that Nanking Red Guards had attempted to attack Sun's mausoleum in the ongoing movement to "destroy the Four Olds" (po sijiu 破四旧), i.e. "old customs, culture, habits, ideas" promoted since summer 1966. But soon Ching-ling disappeared from public view for years, only occasionally meeting some foreign guests. She received special protection in her Peking home – a grandiose compound belonging formerly to the last emperor Puyi's 溥儀 father, while her Shanghai home was ransacked by Red Guards. When her "bourgeois" parents' tomb was smashed and dug up (see below), Zhou Enlai is said to have been the one to arrange at least for some "restoration".

Though she occasionally could keep contact with overseas friends, it was only in the 1970s, especially after the Cultural Revolution's official end, that she emerged again, mostly when foreign or overseas Chinese visitors were involved, until just before her demise in 1981. With the husband buried in the Nanking mausoleum and without own children (just like her sister May-ling), Ching-ling thus finally "returned" to her parents in death, both of whom had died long ago in a rather different world: the Republican era.

The father, Charlie Soong (Song Yaoru 宋耀如), had been a U.S.-trained Methodist pastor. Born in 1861 in Hainan (at the time part of Guangdong Province) in a poor Hakka family, originally named Han Jiaozhun 韓教準, he had converted to Christianity in the U.S. as a youngster after he had run away from his work at a relative's shop in Boston. At the time, he had renamed himself as Soong Jiashu 宋嘉澍 or Charles Jones Soon(g), commonly referred to as Charlie Soong, using "Yaoru 耀如" as his courtesy name.[206] When he came back to China in the 1880s as a missionary of the Southern Methodists, he was sent to the larger Shanghai area. After adjusting to the new environment and language variety,[207] he finally started a family.

---

[205] Apart from Ching-ling and Zhou Enlai, Dong Biwu 董必武, and He Xiangning held speeches, too, as well as Miyazaki Seimin 宮崎世民, nephew of Sun's Japanese close friend Miyazaki Tōten 宮崎滔天 and head of the Sino-Japanese Friendship Association at the time. See the *Renmin ribao* 人民日报 (People's Daily) of Nov. 13, 1966. (Notably, no Westerner was invited to speak in spite of Sun's close relationship to the West, given the strong "anti-imperialist" thrust prevailing at the time.)

[206] For an English-language (non-scholarly) biography, accentuating the U.S.-part of Charlie's life, see E.A. Haag: *Charlie Soong: North Carolina's Link to the Fall of the Last Emperor of China*, Greensboro, NC: Jaan Publishing 2015.

[207] Charlie first had to learn the local "dialect". For written Chinese, he had hardly had any occasion to learn it and thus was looked down upon by Western missionaries as not "really" Chinese. Cf. James Burke, the son of a Methodist missionary close to Charlie Soong and his family: *My Father in China*, New York and Toronto: Farrar & Rinehart 1942, pp. 32-36. Notably, this book was written when the father William Burke was still alive, but the parts on the Soong family were "read and edit[ed]" by "Madame Kung", i.e. Soong Ai-ling, before it went into publishing. (See there p. x.)

Given that he could not feed his family with his small church salary plus some teaching of English,[208] he turned an entrepreneur, i.a. printing Bibles. Over time, he became clandestinely involved in Sun Yat-sen's revolutionary activities, which he helped to finance. When he died in 1918, he was buried in the "Wanguo gongmu" 萬國公墓 or "International Cemetery",[209] i.e. neither in a denominational cemetery nor in a "normal Chinese" one, though the "International Cemetery" – a Chinese creation – mostly hosted affluent Chinese and less foreigners who usually opted for denominational cemeteries. In fact, as Soong May-ling, who had recently come back from her U.S. education to Shanghai, stated in a 1918 letter to her best American friend and classmate, Emma Mills, her father was "the very first person to be buried in that cemetery".[210] (The cemetery had, in fact, been founded before but was transferred recently to this new site.) More surprisingly, there seems to be not much information on the details of Charlie's interment although he was such a crucial figure.

It has been speculated that the reason for this fall from public favour (and attention) lay in his deteriorated relationship with Sun Yat-sen, his close and already married friend, after he discovered that the latter was to take his much younger daughter Ching-ling as his new wife (see also above: the Suns).[211] In fact, after Sun had tried in vain with Soong Ai-ling when she served as his English secretary, first in China at the height of his career after the successful revolution,[212] then in Japan, and finally there in exile after the unsuccessful attempt to overthrow Yuan Shikai's dictatorship in China, Charlie had seen to it that Ai-ling would quickly marry H.H. Kung in Japan. As mentioned, Kung was of a wealthy Shanxi family claiming descent from Confucius, and had been widowed early. After being cured by a missionary as a child, he had become a Christian and went to the U.S. for study, later funding Christian schools in China. In Japan, he worked for some time for the YMCA in Tokyo, which Charlie and family frequented. Ai-ling had already made a point by taking a photograph with H.H. Kung and Lu Muzhen, likely when the latter came to Japan in March 1913.[213] Ching-ling,

---

[208] Well-known Chinese intellectual Hu Shi 胡適, for one, studied English with Charlie as a boy.

[209] On the cemetery, see Müller: *Between History, Heritage, and Foreign Relations* 2018, pp. 13-30.

[210] See Thomas A. DeLong, the cousin of Emma who inherited the letter exchange: *Madame Chiang Kai-shek and Miss Emma Mills: China's First Lady and her American Friend*, Jefferson and London: McFarland & Company 2007, p. 19. According to that letter, as partly cited, partly paraphrased by DeLong, Charlie's natal family had been buried in Canton (!) and the relatives of his Shanghai wife in the West Gate Cemetery in Shanghai. However, He Dazhang, the responsible cadre for the Song Qingling Residence in Peking, provides photographs of Charlie's parents' tombs in his native Wenchang 文昌, Hainan, which is more likely as they apparently always lived there. He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling: Xubian* 2020, p. 4. (The expression "Canton" in the paraphrased letter part might intend Guangdong Province of which Hainan was part at the time, not the city of Guangzhou.)

[211] The already named recent Chinese mainland 30-part TV series on Charlie completely rewrites (and irons out) history in showing Sun Yat-sen melodramatically at Charlie's deathbed as a good son-in-law whom the dying father-in-law obviously reveres as "China's Lincoln", entrusting him with China's future well-being.

[212] With regard to Ai-ling's usual image as "scheming" for power and wealth, it should be noted that she shunned Sun's proposal at a time when his political fortunes were, relatively speaking, at its best (1912/1913). One wonders what she thought of her younger sister Ching-ling's choice of action thereafter.

[213] This interesting rare photograph appears in the popular biographical sketch of the three Soong brothers (touching also on the larger family) by CCP writer Chen Tingyi specialised in such fictive biographies: Chen Tingyi 陈廷一: *Song-shi san xiongdi: Sange yang boshi yu Minguo jingji* 宋氏三兄弟: 三个洋博士与民国经济 (The three Soong brothers: three Western PhDs and the economy of the Republic), Beijing: Dongfang chubanshe 2004, p. 37. The photograph is dated in this book to 1913 and thus could possibly have been taken during Lu

though, who came back in late August of 1913 from the U.S. and succeeded her sister as Sun's secretary in September 1914 when Ai-ling married H.H. Kung,[214] would accept Sun's subsequent proposal to her instead.[215] Charlie decided to take his family back to Shanghai, and he and his wife, who both also knew Sun's wife Lu Muzhen,[216] strongly vetoed the marriage, but at Sun's call, Ching-ling simply eloped from Shanghai back to Japan for an unceremonious marriage with Sun in October 1915.[217] Before this, Sun had quickly arranged for the divorce with his first wife Lu Muzhen to not appear as bigamous to his old Christian friend and unwilling new father-in-law, Charlie, and his wife.[218] As Charlie, who had helped finance Sun's activities over decades, told his missionary friend William Burke thereafter, he had never felt so hurt in life, given that he had considered Sun his "best friend".[219] Although the Soongs finally accepted the situation, things would not return to the former intimacy, neither with Sun, nor with Ching-ling. In any case, when Charlie died in 1918, his burial went by without much apparent attention in China at the time, and his historical role was for a long time obscured.

Charlie's wife, i.e. the mother of the six Soong siblings, Ni Kwei-tseng (Ni Guizhen 倪桂珍), died many years after her husband, in 1931, four years after she had accepted and witnessed the marriage of her youngest daughter May-ling with Chiang Kai-shek in 1927, again himself a formerly married man,[220] whom she reportedly urged to become a Christian. (He duly let himself be baptised three years after the marriage, to his mother-in-law's relief.) As becomes clear not only from May-ling's letters to her American classmate and friend,[221] but also from Western observers,[222] Ni Kwei-tseng had a strong personality – something often overlooked in

Muzhen's ill-starred visit to Japan in March, and since H.H. Kung was based in Tokyo, this could mean it was taken shortly after the car accident, sending a clear signal to Sun.

[214] See Kubota (*Son Bun* 2011), p. 655.

[215] For Ching-ling's views of her relationship with Sun at the time, see the letters she wrote to her American friend Allie Sleep, reproduced in Malcolm Rosholt: "The Shoe Box Letters from China, 1913-1967". In: *Wisconsin Magazine of History*, vol. 73/2, 1989-1990, pp. 111-133.

[216] One may, once again, recall the story of the car accident in Japan of 1913 when Ai-ling and her mother travelled together with her, and Charlie immediately set off to care for them thereafter.

[217] The legal "value" of this certificate provided in a private Japanese home has been disputed. Soong Ching-ling explained shortly before her death, that the reason why the "wedding contract" with Sun Wen showed her name with the character *lin* 琳 instead of *ling* 龄 was because the former character was "more or less the same and easier to write". (De facto the names were written by the Japanese host. The contractors themselves were just to put their seals on. However, only Sun Yat-sen and the Japanese host had an official one at the time and sealed it). See the reproduction of the certificate in: *Sun Zhongshan jinianguan* 2006, p. 94. Ching-ling, who did not understand Japanese, was assisted by Liao Mengxing who translated for her. Interestingly, the contract stipulated that the couple would do the Chinese official registration later – which apparently never happened. (For the *lin* vs. *ling* character, one may note, that also in the case of her sister Ai-ling the character *lin* instead of *ling* was used in Japan at the time. Cf. the reports on the car accident in 1913 in Tokyo mentioned above where Ai-ling had been in the car with Lu Muzhen.)

[218] See Kubota: *Son Bun* 2011, pp. 437-442. As Yang Tianshi suggests, it was above all mother Ni who was adamant about the marriage, while Charlie yielded in the end. See Yang Tianshi: "Song Jiashu", pp. 65-66.

[219] See Burke: *My Father in China* 1942, p. 265.

[220] As mentioned, Chiang officially divorced Mao Fumei, whom his mother had once chosen for him, after his mother's death in 1921, while he claimed that the other relationships he had were only "concubines", not wives.

[221] Cf. the letter exchanges in DeLong: *Madame Chiang Kai-shek and Miss Emma Mills* 2007.

[222] Cf. Edna Lee Booker: *News Is My Job: A Correspondent in War-Torn China*, New York: The Macmillan Company 1940, esp. pp. 30-35, who personally met the family for the first time in 1922 and occasionally thereafter, witnessing also Sun Yat-sen's Peking burial of 1925 and Soong May-ling's marriage ceremony in 1927.

habitually male-centred accounts,[223] and she had no bound feet either. Since she was bigger than Charlie, who was very short, usually family photos were arranged to hide this. According to American correspondent Edna Booker who first met the Soongs in 1922, i.e. after Charlie's death, Ni Kwei-tseng was also one of the three women "shaping" Chiang Kai-shek (the others being Chiang's mother and Soong May-ling, his last wife).[224] Mother Ni was the only one in the family who never lived in the West, only in Japan when the family moved there for shorter stays to avoid repression on the mainland or for health reasons, but she was educated at the missionary Bridgeman girls school in Shanghai and thus had studied English and played the piano (like her daughters). She had also received a training in Chinese classics at home. (That she spoke some English is testified to, e.g., by May-ling's U.S.-friend Emma Mills who stayed with the family for some time.)[225] Notably, the Bible she intensively used every day was in English, while in the Soong household the spoken language was (her) Shanghainese.

In fact, it seems the Soong children never learnt Cantonese (or even Hakka) from their father. In writing, Charlie himself, who had not much schooling in written Chinese, seems to have preferred English, e.g. when communicating with his Cantonese/Hakka/English-speaking friend Sun Yat-sen.[226] Gleaned from various remarks, the Soong siblings normally spoke Shanghainese, when talking in "Chinese", or else in English. May-ling, e.g., is said to have kept her Shanghainese into old age, though with her husband Chiang Kai-shek, who knew no English, she learned to deal with his Zhejiang accent. (For official speeches, Mandarin pronunciation was the supposed standard to follow, especially since the 1920s.) Given her husband's preferences, May-ling was also the one to study most intensively of all siblings Classical Chinese. Ching-ling, in turn, obviously did not learn to understand Cantonese from her husband Sun Yat-sen any more than from her father and thus conversed with her stepson Sun Fo and with her husband Sun Yat-sen, too, in English.[227] In short, the Soong siblings kept their Shanghainese as their dominant household Chinese topolect, and usually communicated

[223] There is ample evidence from Western as well as Chinese sources – as well as from her children's remarks – that she dominated much of the affairs of the family, also helped by the fact of her local family connections, and, of course, by outliving her husband. She was active in church matters in various capacities, but was also investing in the stock exchange after Charlie's death on her own. (Cf. DeLong: *Madame Chiang Kai-shek* 2007, p. 43, referring to May-ling's letters to Emma Mills of 1921 over her mother's recent failed investments.) Cf. also the short description of Ni Kwei-tseng in Haag (*Charlie Soong* 2015), pp. 115-117, and in Burke (*My Father in China* 1942), pp.37-38. For a very detailed discussion of the Ni family members and their mutual relations, which includes also Ni Kwei-tseng and her immediate family, see Luo Yuanxu: *Dongcheng xijiu* 2014, pp. 134-217.

[224] Booker: *News* 1940, p. 233.

[225] See DeLong: *Madame Chiang Kai-shek* 2007, p. 48.

[226] One may recall that Sun Yat-sen's background was Cantonese (and possibly Hakka – see above: the Suns), though he did speak Mandarin (with Cantonese accent), too, and English.

[227] This can be gleaned from the fact that she had problems understanding the Chinese of her good friend Liao Chengzhi who mentioned that he used to speak English with Ching-ling since she had a hard time understanding his Cantonese-tainted Mandarin, while he did not understand well her Shanghainese accent. Cf. Liao's "condolences" (Wo de diaoyan 我的吊唁), published in *Renmin ribao* May 31, 1981, p. 2. Even official sources occasionally admit that Ching-ling also spoke English with Sun Yat-sen. (Cf. He Husheng: *Babaoshan jishi* vol. 2, p. 783). Similarly, as a Chinese god-daughter of Sun Fo noticed in Chungking in 1944, Soong Ching-ling talked English with Sun Fo – whose native tongue was Cantonese, though he at least understood some other varieties, given that he translated Huang Xing, the military head of the revolutionaries, who was from Hunan, into Cantonese. (See the cited memoir in Shen Feide: *Minguo diyi jia* 2002, p. 134.) Ching-ling's wedding photo which she gave to her friend and noted Chinese literary figure Liu Yazi 柳亞子 she signed with her English initials "SCL". See *Sun Zhongshan jinianguan* 2006, p. 95.

among themselves (and their in-laws often, too), especially when written, in English – something often overlooked.[228] For "official" communications, they would have secretaries, well versed in Classical Chinese. Their role, too, has often been ignored when, e.g., interpreting the sometimes politically crucial Chinese letters T.V. Soong "wrote" to Chiang Kai-shek.

Mother Ni's strong position in the Soong household was also due to her background. She was of a noted Shanghai family, and she was a devout Christian. In fact, Ni Kwei-tseng's own mother was a descendant of Xu Guangqi 徐光啓, the famous Ming-era convert of the Jesuits to become a pillar of early (Catholic) Christianity in China,[229] while Ni Kwei-tseng's father was a Protestant pastor. (This had required the mother of Ni Kwei-tseng to become Protestant as well, while her own native Xu family remained Catholic.) The Ni family was integrated in a web of well-to-do Chinese Christians,[230] which opened many doors to Charlie and meant an "upward marriage" for him. In fact, Charlie, who had met two participants in the earliest Chinese educational mission to the U.S. when still living in Boston with his relative,[231] was introduced by them to pastor Ni's family when he worked as a preacher in the Shanghai area. He thus became the brother-in-law of both of them, Won Bing Chung (Wen Bingzhong 温秉忠) and New Shan Chou (Niu Shangzhou 牛尚周), via the three Ni daughters they had married in the 1880s. One of them, Won Bing Chung, who had become a Qing government official, would, in fact, take the Soong daughters Ching-ling and May-ling with him in 1907 to the U.S. for study. A year earlier, he had taken Ai-ling, who was already in the U.S. for study at this point, to a meeting with President Theodore Roosevelt, whom she reportedly embarrassed with criticism of American racist behaviour she had experienced.[232] Charlie and his wife Ni Kwei-tseng had raised their children in an unorthodox way from a Chinese point of view in many respects, also not making much difference between the girls and the boys. They apparently also did not consider their daughters as "given away" by marriage. Notably, the only well-known photograph showing the whole Soong family was taken in 1917, one year before Charlie's death, when two of the daughters were already married (Ai-ling and Ching-ling), but without their husbands and Ai-ling's children of whom two were born at the time. (The fact that all of the children went abroad for study one after the other also did not facilitate a family photograph of all. The youngest, T.A., e.g., was not yet born when Ai-ling was already away, and when May-ling returned, T.L. was about to leave, so 1917 was the just moment.) Therewith, they

[228] It is striking to see that most of the family letters are in English, including those to the sibling's partners – with the obvious exception of Chiang Kai-shek who did not understand English. While especially May-ling tried to brush up her written Chinese as well as her calligraphy, Lin Bowen, a journalist of the Chinese-language press in the U.S., living in New York, at least commented on T.V.'s difficulties with written Chinese. See Lin Bowen 林博文: *Zhang Xueliang, Song Ziwen dang'an da jiemi* 張學良，宋子文檔案大揭秘 (Archival revelations regarding Zhang Xueliang and T.V. Soong), Taipei: Shibao wenhua 2007, pp. 234-236.

[229] Xu Guangqi was an official at the Ming court and collaborator of Father Matteo Ricci, SJ, who started the Jesuit mission in China.

[230] For the Nis as one of "seven influential Christian Chinese families" (actually Protestant ones) who were also key actors in Sino-Western cultural exchange, see the already mentioned study by Luo Yuanxu: *Dongcheng xijiu* 2014, pp. 134-217.

[231] On the educational mission, see Edward J.M. Rhoads: *Stepping Forth into the World the Chinese Educational Mission to the United States, 1872-81*, Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press; Seattle: University of Washington Press, 2011. See also the website on the Chinese Educational Mission: https://web.archive.org/web/20111203051310/http://www.cemconnections.org/.

[232] The background was her initial difficulty at the San Francisco immigration to enter the U.S., given that she travelled with a Portuguese ID card father Charlie had bought for her.

documented the natal family as such. And the Soong parents differed from the "standard" in China also in one further aspect: they raised their children decidedly in the Christian (Methodist) faith.

Ni Kwei-tseng died in Qingdao, where she had stayed for health reasons. Her death occurred just hours after an attempt at the life of her eldest son, T.V., then serving as, i.a., minister of finance in Chiang Kai-shek's cabinet, who only narrowly escaped and then had to take up immediately the duty of the eldest son to care for the funeral of his mother.[233] Ni Kwei-tseng's Christian funeral in Shanghai, for which many celebrities arrived, was widely reported,[234] given the high profile of her family members, namely of her sons-in-law, which earned her the title "mother-in-law of the country".[235] Her burial at the side of Charlie in the "International Cemetery" initiated a process of remaking the tomb, and it was noted that the Soong parents had acquired a whole "family tomb slot" in Western fashion, apparently intending to stay with all of their children (i.e. the daughters included) in death.[236]

The tomb implied a further link between the family members over mother Ni who had tried to keep the family together in her lifetime, although she could not prevent the rift between, above all, Ching-ling and Chiang Kai-shek. Ching-ling resented Chiang's donning the robe of the heir to her husband Sun Yat-sen, as much as she did not agree with his interpretation of Sun's political legacy. While the political differences came into the open in the critical year of 1927 with Chiang's turning against the Communists and the months-long rivalling governments of (leftist) Wuhan, sustained by Ching-ling, T.V., and Sun's son Sun Fo, and (rightist) Nanking under Chiang, the marriage of May-ling with Chiang was on the horizon. Not only Ching-ling, but also T.V. had not welcomed the idea of having Chiang as a brother-in-law,[237] but the rest of the family did, namely the Kungs, and mother Ni approved it on the named condition of Chiang's earnest studying Christianity for possible conversion. May-ling herself, having delayed marriage well beyond the usual age, was convinced, too.[238] By the time of the marriage, the Wuhan government had broken with the Communists as well, compromised with the Nanking government, and merged with the latter. T.V., himself just recently wed, thus acquiesced also on the private front to the family decision. As the eldest male, he acted instead of his dead father at the marriage ceremony in December 1927 in Shanghai – a huge social event, while Ching-ling, in spite of mother Ni's pleas for family unity,[239] preferred to leave

[233] It is striking that the family-approved Fudan-Hoover biographical volume on T.V. (Wu and Kuo: *Song Ziwen yu tade shidai* 2013) skips the assassination attempt completely.
[234] See, e.g., in *The North-China Herald*, August 25, 1931, p. 267, and photographs on p. 286.
[235] See "The Mother-in-Law". In: *The North-China Herald*, July 28, 1931, p. 114. The Shanghai newspaper *Shenbao* also followed events around her death and burial closely.
[236] Ching-ling stated this to her secretary. See He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling* 2016, p. 372. This underlines that the Soongs apparently did not see their daughters as automatically "given away" to their husbands' families as Chinese custom would suggest, although Charlie's original tombstone with only the male children named reflects Chinese custom. It might be noted that Ai-ling and her husband H.H. Kung also arranged for their daughters and son-in-law to be included in their New York Ferncliff mausoleum private rooms.
[237] Cf. Yang Tianshi with reference to Chiang's diaries: *Zhaoxun zhenshi de Jiang Jieshi* vol. 2, p. 505. As it seems, it was H.H. Kung as husband of the eldest Soong sibling Ai-ling, who negotiated the marriage.
[238] Her views on marriage in general and her own one, in particular, can be gleaned from her letters to her American classmate who never married, Emma Mills. See DeLong: *Madame Chiang Kai-shek* 2007, e.g. p. 77.
[239] See He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling: Xubian* 2020, p. 227.

China well before the event for Moscow and later Berlin.[240] She only came back briefly for Sun's entombment in the Nanking mausoleum in 1929, a procedure then dominated by Chiang whom she publicly attacked. Only at mother Ni's funeral in 1931, she finally moved back to China. T.V., who repeatedly disagreed with Chiang as well, was apparently more flexible,[241] not the least cautioned by the assassination attempt which was attributed to leftists who took issue with him, too, on the very day of mother Ni's death, as mentioned. In any case, given these complicated relationships, the usual obligation of the siblings and their partners of sweeping the Soong parents' tomb was an inter-family challenge. Photographs or published news of the time thus either document Ching-ling (with brother T.A.), T.V., or the Chiang couple (at times with the Kungs) looking after the parents' tomb.[242]

The most important document for the tomb's original setup is a photograph dated by Ching-ling to 1932, showing herself and her youngest brother T.A. at the side of Charlie's tombstone, with the recently buried mother's tomb apparently not yet finished (which was done in August 1932, according to the dating of the subsequent common tombstone of the couple). Ching-ling reportedly handed out this photograph (and not one with the later common tombstone) when she prepared for her own burial.[243] Notably, at closer scrutiny, the photograph of Charlie's tomb reveals that originally only the three sons – in traditional fashion – were named as responsible for the tombstone's erection, and the Christian identity of Charlie is revealed by the English phrase on the top: "Thy will be done". (The lower part of the tombstone is covered by a wreath but clearly figures some horizontal English inscription, likely a pious phrase taken from the Bible.)

Thus, also religion comes in with the tomb since Charlie and his wife were devout Christians. The KMT they and above all their (later) sons-in-law who all were baptised Protestants at some point, stood for, had in larger part, however, ambivalent feelings about religion at best. An

[240] In Moscow, she was treated by the Soviets as an official guest, while her stay in Berlin was private. Cf. Epstein: *Woman in World History* 1993, p. 225. (This also meant she needed funds from home since she apparently never earned anything herself, while, e.g., He Xiangning who had sided with the leftist Wuhan government as well and left China, too, after the tumultuous events in 1927, financed her partly contemporaneous stays in Europe by selling her artwork.)

[241] T.V. had a complicated on-and-off relationship with Chiang Kai-shek. Though T.V. helped Chiang raise money time and again, he was less categorically opposed to the Communists and the Soviets than Chiang. The two of them clashed repeatedly during the 1930s and 1940s, and T.V. finally chose to settle down in the U.S. for good. After 1949, T.V. was also reluctant to travel to Taiwan, given that his KMT membership had been revoked in the early 1950s (see Wu and Kuo: *Song Ziwen yu tade shidai* 2013, p. 142), and only in 1963 followed an invitation by Chiang for a visit. Apparently, it was T.A. who patched up things by the 1960s. See He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling: Xubian* 2020, pp. 232-233. On the other hand, he was on the blacklist of the Communists, too.

[242] For reports of the Chiang couple (at times with the Kungs) visiting the tomb – notably usually called the "Soong *mother*'s tomb", see, e.g., the Shanghai newspaper *Shenbao*, which has such entries for 1932, 1935, 1947, and twice 1948. Cf. also Müller: *Between History* 2018, p. 25, n. 102. Apart from the fact that the mother was the one who had died more recently, Chiang, e.g., had no personal link to Charlie (though they might have met earlier in Tongmenghui/KMT contexts), and the press, in turn, reported the cemetery visits mainly from the viewpoint of following Chiang Kai-shek's itinerary.

[243] On the rear side of the photograph, it is identified in English as "Tse An and I visiting our father's grave in 1932" (which begs the question as to whom it was originally intended to be given). See, e.g., the book of the head of the Beijing Soong Ching-ling Residence He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling* 2016, photograph on p. 371, and discussion of Ching-ling's burial choice on pp. 372-374. The photograph was also put up in the Song Qingling Memorial Park exhibition at my visit.

undated photograph, possibly taken soon after the common tombstone of the parents was set up in August 1932, of T.V. Soong and his wife at the parents' tomb, which is unfortunately only visible for the lower part, shows the common tombstone as it appeared after mother Ni had joined her husband, figuring now all six siblings as the bereaved.[244] This way, also the in-laws could be indirectly attached to the tomb over the Soong sisters who, after all, were the more "famous" ones due to their marriages. The English inscription on the lower part is, in any case, gone, and the structure has become imposing. The whole setup suggest a more "nationalised" style in contrast to the much more personal one of Charlie's original tomb when pious mother Ni was still alive, making sure her husband's Christian identity was visible.

It is not clear whether the tomb had remained untouched over the Japanese occupation period, since the "International Cemetery" had been damaged during the time following the Battle of Shanghai (though the collaborationist regime would put the cemetery in order again),[245] and none of the Soongs was there at the time. But in any case, after the war it was certainly looked after, not the least when May-ling attended the burial of the family's close friend William Donald in 1946, close-by in the same cemetery.[246] And before leaving the mainland for good, the Soong siblings bid farewell respectively to their parents' tomb. The last visit of May-ling with Chiang Kai-shek reported in the newspaper was of October 10, 1948.[247]

While the KMT had been ambivalent towards religion, the Communists in PRC times were, of course, straightforwardly anti-religious from the outset. Charlie had furthermore been an active entrepreneur and financed Sun Yat-sen's various endeavours. In the perspective of the Communists, he thus had credits for helping the "bourgeois revolution" of Sun, but still he was a "capitalist", and a religious person on top of this. This meant that the tomb of the Soong parents did not always fare well in the times of the PRC, and the tombstone erected by the politically diverse children and their families was a stumbling block. After 1949, due to Ching-ling's position in the PRC as a nominal leading figure (if without any real power), she had hoped for her parents' tomb to remain untouched. But during the Cultural Revolution when she

[244] This highly interesting photograph appears in bad quality in the already referred-to popular fictive biographical sketch of the three Soong brothers by Chen Tingyi: *Song-shi san xiongdi* 2004, p. 168. My guess of the time refers to the apparently fresh colour of the inscription, and T.V. as the eldest of the sons was per se the key responsible figure for setting it up. (Given the perspective of the photograph, one cannot ascertain whether the only partly visible tombstone – or the horizontal slabs – had Christian markers at the time: at least there are none visible on this photograph.)

[245] Cf. Müller: *Between Heritage* 2018, p. 14, n. 59.

[246] The Australian advisor to the Soong, Kung and Chiang families, William H. Donald, had been buried close to the Soong parents at his death in 1946. For his funeral, see *Shenbao* Nov. 11, 1946, p. 5: "Guoqi fugai lingjiu. Duanna zuo xing zangli 國旗覆蓋靈柩. 端納昨行葬禮 (National flag covers coffin: Donald buried yesterday), partly translated in English: "W.H. Donald's Funeral in Shanghai", available online: http://www.donaldofchina.com/Don_Who_/Press1/Life1/Book/Play/funeral.html. Pakula: *The Last Empress* 2009, p. 547, even claims that May-ling "had him buried *in* the Soong family plot", though this is quite unlikely. In fact, as a *Shenbao* news of the day of burial states, his tomb was designed to be "in a corner" of the cemetery "with two slots". (See "Duanna jinri anzang" 端納今日安葬 (Donald buried today). *Shenbao* Nov. 10, 1946, p. 5). His tomb, however, has been levelled during the Cultural Revolution at the latest and in any case is no longer there. Cf. also Müller: *Between History* 2018, pp. 14-15.

[247] See the mentioned visit in *Shenbao* 申報 October 10, 1948, p. 2: "Zongtong fufu feifan shoudu" 總統夫婦飛返首都 (The presidential couple flies back to the capital).

herself was threatened and the "struggle" went from the living also over to the dead, while "bourgeois" cemeteries were in any case among the "Four Olds" to be attacked, it was desecrated nevertheless, even with the remains exposed (the so-called *bao shi* 暴尸, a Chinese ancient post-mortem punishment), which reportedly deeply shocked her.[248] In the end, neither of her parents had lived into the PRC, nor had they been political figures themselves, but they were to "pay" for their offspring this way under a system she stood for. Ching-ling is said to have felt guilty towards her parents ever since whom she had upset already during lifetime. It is not entirely clear when this happened between summer 1966 and early 1967, or whether the attacks were repeatedly undertaken. According to her biographer Epstein, Ching-ling received a photo of the destroyed tomb of her parents, and Liao Mengxing helped forward it to Zhou Enlai for help.[249] Epstein links this to Zhou Enlai's list of cadres to be protected (which was handed to Mao for approval end of August 1966, with Ching-ling heading the list). If so, her public speech at Sun's 100th birthday celebration in November could also be read as a defensive attempt for herself and her family as much as of Sun's legacy. The Shanghai Song Qingling Memorial Park argues for January or February 1967,[250] which would be after Sun Yat-sen's 100th birthday celebrations, for the destruction of the Soong tomb in the context of vandalism of cemeteries in the Shanghai area more generally. In any case, this "struggle mode" became particularly "popular" from late autumn 1966 onward. (The case of the Confucius Cemetery in November 1966 with a similar treatment of the dead which was widely reported and thus became a kind of "role model", comes to mind.)[251] An archival report in Shanghai of late 1966 suggests widespread attacks on tombs had already taken place by then – and encouraged further ones.[252] A tombstone mentioning the politically "problematic" siblings back then, or the display of any Christian symbols or identity markers were clearly anathema at this point.[253] A photograph said to be taken just after the visible damage was repaired (while the remains of the parents had been reburied), and sent to Ching-ling (then in Peking), shows that the remade tombstone only figured the parents' name, and only herself as the one who "built it". Notably, now Charlie's alternate Chinese name "Jiashu" 嘉樹 appeared instead of his courtesy name "Yaoru" 耀如 which had been originally on Charlie's tombstone as well as on the pre-1949 common tombstone – as the Republican-era photographs documented –, by this "downgrading" him. Furthermore, on the new version, the surnames of Charlie (Soong)

[248] That such a treatment of "problematic" tombs of earlier times was fairly "typical" during the Cultural Revolution becomes abundantly clear by the frequent mentioning in Yang Guoqing: *Minguo mingren mu* 1998.
[249] See Epstein: *Woman in World History* 1993, p. 551. The photo taken of the destroyed tomb which spurred the "restoration" is – to my knowledge – not released.
[250] Cf. the already referred-to article by Zhang Jieming: "Song Qingling", available online: http://www.shsoongching-ling.com/sqlxslt/xslt_yj/list200.html, referring to Liao Mengxing's recollections. Her daughter, Li Mei, sustains this with a letter of Deng Yingchao 邓颖超, Zhou Enlai's wife, to Liao Mengxing, of March 1967, stating that the remains were reburied and the tombstone was not destroyed. It thus could be "adapted" in terms of inscription. See Li Mei: *Jiaguo mengying* 2015, pp. 348-349. However, as noted below, the inscription was not only "reduced" to Soong Ching-ling as the one to set it up, but also the inscription of Charlie and his wife's names was changed. In short, the change was larger than suggested.
[251] Cf. Sang Ye and Barmé: "Commemorating Confucius". Available online: http://www.chinaheritagequarterly.org/scholarship.php?searchterm=020_confucius.inc&issue=020.
[252] Cf. Müller: *Between History* 2018, p. 29.
[253] Soong Ching-ling also evaded any display of a Christian identity in PRC times but for the Christmas tree she continued to set up as photos of PRC times disclose, and by sending out Christmas cards designed by herself showing candles etc. As mentioned above, since the marriage with Sun Yat-sen in 1915 which was heavily criticised by not only Chinese friends but missionaries as well, Sun and his new wife seem to have stopped going to church. In PRC times, a Christian identity would obviously not have looked well for a nominal leading figure.

and his wife (Ni) remained without colouring,[254] and, obviously, the honorific addenda to the names as on the original tombstone were impossible to keep at the time.

After the Cultural Revolution, when most of the historical actors had also died, the political potential of the Soong family tomb as an "integrative" measure to bring together "China" via its split-up representatives has been "rediscovered" by the PRC. Thus, in today's version of the parents' tombstone going back to the 1980s, all six Soong children are named as the bereaved again as they were on the couple's Republican-era common tombstone. The daughters thus were and are implicitly subsumed by this under their natal family name "Soong", too, and Ching-ling's tomb is situated physically in front to the right (in the beholder's view). It should be noted that she was referred to as "Soong" only, not using her husband's name "Sun" altogether[255] – in pointed difference to her sisters whose tombstones in the U.S. figure "Soong K'ung" and "Chiang Soong" respectively. Thus, she was to the foreigners (and to overseas' Chinese) "Madame Sun Yat-sen", but in the PRC "Song Qingling", and finally – as she was officially accepted into the CCP on her deathbed[256] – on her tomb slab: "Comrade Song Qingling".

The set-up of the present tomb area is placed in the "Song Qingling Memorial Park", named after Ching-ling posthumously and outbalancing the mere "daughter" status of the arrangement (which as such could also lead to the assumption that she was never married) by this naming, with an added large statue of her in front of the road to the tomb. But in layout, it is the Soong parents' tomb which de facto is the centre, connecting the re-constructed "foreigners' cemetery" to the right side (in the beholder's view), and the "cemetery of famous Chinese" on the left side of their tomb.[257] Symbolically, this is intriguing since this way the per se private tomb of a Christian "bourgeois" couple, connecting China and the "greater" world in life and in death, is central to this place acknowledged by the CCP in central Shanghai as a "national-level patriotic education showcase base". The Christian identity of the couple, though, is not disclosed in any way today. Ching-ling is placed to the side corresponding her place in birth sequence as also reflected on the tombstone of the parents with the names of the bereaved: the eldest (of the sons and of the daughters respectively) is in the middle, the next eldest to the right (in the beholder's view), the youngest to the left. To balance the tomb and in view of the absence of the other siblings, or any own children of Ching-ling,[258] she arranged for her housekeeper, "sister" Li

[254] Usually, the surnames, representing the family line, would be marked, often in red. According to He Dazhang (himself born in 1948 and thus living the Cultural Revolution experience consciously), during Cultural Revolution times the colour "red" was impossible to use in this case (i.e. a "bourgeois" tomb) without creating "political problems". (He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling: Xubian* 2020, pp. 43-44.)

[255] On one level, this conforms also to PRC style, i.e. to keep the women's natal family name, but one may also recall that her status had been questioned repeatedly by those of the KMT who disliked her "leftism" – and the side-lining of Lu Muzhen, even if this had clearly not been her initiative, but Sun's.

[256] It has been established by historian Yang Kuisong 杨奎松 that she actually entered the Communist Party via the Russians in the 1930s, but officially she was more "useful" as a KMT figure with "sympathies" for the Communists. Cf. Jung Chang: *Big Sister* 2019, p. 165. She thus became an official member of the *Chinese* Communist Party only briefly before her death.

[257] For more on the "foreigners' cemetery", see Müller: *Between history* (2018), pp. 13-31.

[258] She particularly cared for two daughters of a staff member, sometimes assumed to be her adopted daughters, which the cadre responsible for her Peking residence, however, denies. See He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song*

Yan'e 李燕娥 who had been with her over 50 years and who died briefly before her, to be buried at the left side.[259] Following spatial logic, that place would correspond to May-ling. Some of the larger mural structure of Republican times can be gleaned from the already mentioned undated photograph of T.V. and his wife at the tomb. The other siblings' intended burial spaces were, in any case, empty. In short, the arrangement of the family tomb in Shanghai suggests that the housekeeper's tomb was very probably de facto a "stand-in" for May-ling who at the time was still alive.

What Ching-ling's still living siblings T.L. and May-ling (or the family members of the died ones) in the U.S. thought of this strange "last minute" arrangement by Ching-ling with the "family tomb" is not publicly known. Years later, the last will of May-ling is said to have included the option to transfer her own remains at some "feasible" point in time to the parents' (and her sister's) tomb as well. For the time being, May-ling, however, rather wanted to stay close in death to her sister Ai-ling and her family in New York.[260] Theoretically, the ones now holding family claims to their grandparents' Shanghai tombs are the sons of T.A. in the U.S., because T.A. was the only one of the three Soong sons to sire male offspring,[261] continuing the Soong "family line".[262] For the time being, it is, however, only Ching-ling, the "wayward" daughter, who is with the Soong parents in death, and who "defined" (or "revolutionised") the family tomb's setup by the placement of her housekeeper.

Qingling 2016, pp. 291-314. Ching-ling is also said to have quietly remarried with her secretary, though he would not be able to join her in death and is not part of her official history.

[259] He Dazhang provides a short, though somewhat vague, portrait of Li Yan'e, hailing from Sun Yat-sen's native place. (She apparently came to Ching-ling after his death, though, i.e. after Ching-ling's return to China in 1931 for her mother's burial). Cf. He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling* 2016, pp. 358-363, also providing more details of Soong Ching-ling's arranging for her burial in the Soong family slot. Soong Ching-ling had a substantial staff in Peking as well as in Shanghai, some certainly with an also political function to keep her contacts under control.

[260] It has been stressed repeatedly, that the siblings outside of the mainland did care for Ching-ling, not the least May-ling in spite of Ching-ling's and Chiang Kai-shek's political and personal contrasts. It is plausible that also Ching-ling cared for her siblings more than PRC sources would allow to state. For a recent cautiously revisionist PRC treatment, stressing her post-Cultural Revolution attempts to come into contact with May-ling after the death of the major "stumbling block" Chiang Kai-shek, though Chiang Ching-kuo was still there who did not favour the Soongs in general, see He Dazhang: *Yige zhenshi de Song Qingling: Xubian* 2020, pp. 387-404. Notably, while all other siblings are treated, T.L. largely disappears from the narrative on all sides.

[261] T.V. had three daughters, T.L. one daughter (who died after him but before her mother), while T.A. had two sons.

[262] The wife of T.A.'s younger son, Soong Tsao Li-hsuan, actively pursues research into the archival materials at the Hoover Institute which hosts, as mentioned, the materials handed over by the Soong-Kung-Chiang families. (The other publicly involved family member of the technically next generation, Michael Feng, is the son of T.V.'s eldest daughter who transferred T.V.'s archives to the Hoover Institute. He even had himself baptised in 2015 at the Methodist church in Wilmington, North Carolina, where his maternal great-grandfather Charlie had done so 135 years earlier, recalling the "family tradition". See: "A baptism stirs memories, 135 years afterwards". Available online: https://chapelboro.com/town-square/columns/one-on-one/a-baptism-stirs-memories-135-years-afterwards.)

Concluding remarks

On a final note, the Chinese mainland has unquestionably the decisive advantage of being the place of origin also for many Overseas Chinese and Taiwan "mainlanders", including Republican-era "V.I.P.s" and their offspring, offering a "grave at home". This, however, is a device not without political overtones. But the history of treatment of tombs in the PRC is not exactly an advertisement.[263] This even includes key Communist cadres of Republican times, some of whom have been interred in, and exhumed from, respected burial plots, according to changing political winds after their deaths. Notorious cases include Qu Qiubai 瞿秋白, the writer, journalist and one-time leader of the CCP (1928-1930), who was executed in a KMT prison in 1935. Nonetheless, he was reviled during the Cultural Revolution as having become a "renegade" in prison, with specialised publications against him, leading to a throwing-up of his physical remains in the Babaoshan Cemetery in Peking, to be later "rehabilitated" and honoured again.[264] Zhou Enlai is said to have been the one to initiate this national burial site, i.e. the Babaoshan Cemetery in Peking, for "martyrs" and respected cadres, paying heed to the fact that somehow the nation had to show its appreciation for those who worked and died for it, even including some foreigners. This suggested centralisation of their tombs. (Incidentally, the Babaoshan location had served as a burial site in imperial times already, though for the court eunuchs.) On the other hand, such a site could serve for the education of the young, urging them to make sure that the sacrifices of earlier generations were not in vain. This, of course, had also Soviet models, and it had KMT precedents.

Given the fact that cemeteries were a "standard" object of attack during the Cultural Revolution, Zhou Enlai is said to have reframed the naming of the Babaoshan Cemetery in 1970 after the heftiest attacks on tombs all over the country in the early Cultural Revolution had subsided, as a "revolutionary" cemetery for better safeguarding.[265] But in today's marketised environment, burial plots in this most prestigious Babaoshan Cemetery have to be bought, and costs have not been only rising significantly, but space is simply running out.[266] Thus, after the encouragement to practice the tradition to bury the dead at their place of origin, thus shifting the remains to the respective localities and closer to the families, whom by this was given more of a share, the sheer mass of requests for burial plots posed continued problems. These even included price-driving speculation by "early buyers" which also occurred with other "elite cemeteries"

[263] For a present-day anthropological study on "governing souls" in modern China, see Andrew B. Kipnis: "Governing the souls of Chinese modernity". In: *HAU: Journal of Ethnographic Theory* vol. 7/2, 2017, pp. 217-238.

[264] Issues of the anti-Qu *Tao Qu zhanbao* 讨瞿战报 (Anti-Qu battle news) are reprinted in Yongyi Song (ed.): *A New Collection of Red Guard Publications. Part II: A Special Compilation of Newspapers in Beijing Area*, vol. 29, pp. 11446-11532. On the Babaoshan tomb's desecration, see pp. 11454-11455 (of June 5, 1967). Red Guards elsewhere destroyed the tombs of both of his parents respectively.

[265] For a brief historical overview on the Babaoshan Cemetery, see Wang Jianzhu 王建柱: "Tanfang Babaoshan geming gongmu" 探访八宝山革命公墓 (Visiting the Babaoshan Revolutionary Cemetery). In: *Dangshi wenyuan* 党史文苑 (Writings on Party history) 2014/4, pp. 46-49. A more extensive official treatment is the already named 3 volume publication of He Husheng: *Babaoshan jishi* 1998.

[266] Cf. Liu Ziqian 刘子倩: "Babaoshan 'manyuan'" 八宝山"满员" (Babaoshan is full). In: *Lingdao wencui* 领导文萃 (Leaders' Digest) 2014/5, pp. 122-124 (reprinted from *Zhongguo xinwen zhoukan* 中国新闻周刊 [China Newsweek]).

around the country, bespeaking also the traditional belief that "good" (if not auspicious) burial places need to be carefully chosen. This led to the present official advocating of "eco burials", i.e. dispersal of the ashes in nature, which, then, would "solve the grave problems" of everyone, including the V.I.P.s (and, by extension, their families), in another, more radical sense. All that is left behind, then, is memory, which is malleable and can more easily be tailored to respective private or public needs of posterity without having to bother any longer about the dead themselves.